



MURRAY CITY MUNICIPAL COUNCIL

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

The Murray City Municipal Council met on Tuesday, September 1, 2020 for a meeting held electronically in accordance with the provisions of Utah Code 52-4-207(4), Open and Public Meeting Act, due to infectious disease COVID-19 Novel Coronavirus. Council Chair, Rosalba Dominguez, determined that to protect the health and welfare of Murray citizens, an in person City Council meeting, including attendance by the public and the City Council is not practical or prudent. She stated:

Considering the continued rise of COVID-19 case counts in Utah, meeting in an anchor location presents substantial risk to the health and safety of those in attendance because physical distancing measures may be difficult to maintain in the Murray City Council Chambers. The Center for Disease Control states that COVID-19 is easily spread from person to person between people who are in close contact with one another. The spread is through respiratory droplets when an infected person coughs, sneezes or talks and may be spread by people who are non-symptomatic. The intent is to safeguard the lives of Murray residents, business owners, employees and elected officials by meeting remotely through electronic means without an anchor location.

The public may view the meeting via the live stream at:

www.murraycitylive.com or <https://www.facebook.com/Murraycityutah/>

Citizen comments or public hearing comments may be submitted by sending an email in advance or during the meeting to city.council@murray.utah.gov. Comments are limited to less than three minutes, include your name and contact information, and they will be read into the record.

Council Members in Attendance:

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------|
| Rosalba Dominguez - Chair | District #3 |
| Kat Martinez | District #1 |
| Dale Cox | District #2 |
| Brett Hales | District #5 |

Absent:

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------|
| Diane Turner – Vice Chair | District #4 |
|---------------------------|-------------|

Others in Attendance:

| | | | |
|------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|------------------------------|
| Blair Camp | Mayor | Janet Lopez | City Council Director |
| Doug Hill | Mayor's CAO | Jennifer Kennedy | City Recorder |
| Jennifer Heaps | Chief Communications Officer | Pattie Johnson | City Council Office Admin. |
| Kim Sorensen | Parks and Recreation Director | John Pearson | Golf Course – Golf Pro |
| Brenda Moore | Finance Director | Dave Carruth | Golf Course – Superintendent |
| G.L. Critchfield | City Attorney | Bill Francis | The Imagination Company |

Ms. Dominguez called the Committee of the Whole meeting to order at 5:45 p.m.

Approval of Minutes – Ms. Dominguez asked for comments or a motion on the minutes from the July 7, 2020 Committee of the Whole; and July 21, 2020 Committee of the Whole meetings. Ms. Martinez moved approval. Mr. Cox seconded the motion. Approved 4-0

Discussion Items

Murray Parkway Golf Course Fees – Mr. Sorensen spoke about increasing golf course fees at Murray's Parkway golf course, and reviewed the proposal to do so. He noted there had not been an increase in five years. Last month, the proposal was presented to the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board who studied the fee increases and unanimously approved forwarding the decision on to the City Council for consideration. The draft amendment to the ordinance was noted, along with proposed increases for green fees, and all rentals. (See Attachment #1)

Mr. Sorensen reported that currently the City's golf course fees are below the average cost for golfing in the Salt Lake valley; and proposed increases would place the City's prices at middle-range compared to other courses in the valley – and slightly below those considered most similar to Murray. The Council would consider the fee increases at the next council meeting.

Council Comments and Discussion:

- Mr. Cox commended golf course staff for doing a great job despite recent budget cuts. He understood working hours had not changed regardless, and hiring additional summer help was not an option this year. He said staff had done an excellent job keeping the operation going, and keeping the course well maintained. He noted some worked long shifts from early morning to late nights, when other employees required a day off. He asked Mr. Sorensen to extend great appreciation to his staff.
- Mr. Sorensen echoed those thoughts, as it had been a difficult year with social distancing. He agreed staff did fabulous in keeping things safe for customers, while maintaining excellent service.

Diversity and Inclusion Advisory Committee – Ms. Martinez stated the primary focus of creating a Diversity and Inclusion Advisory Committee was to move the City from a place of equality to equity. A power point was shared to discuss the details. (See Attachment #2)

Her presentation can be viewed at:

<https://youtu.be/OMN7quM0dzA?list=PLQBSQKtwzBqLxiqGGqdVorSUzCOAEmh-2&t=460>

Ms. Martinez reminded the Council of her initial presentation at previous Committee of the Whole meeting when she sought a level of interest in forming the new committee. After much research, her hope was to continue their interest by presenting more information about the Diversity and Inclusion Advisory Committee.

Two separate draft ordinances were provided to the Council; Ms. Martinez explained two possible voting options for either a codified long term board; or an Ad Hoc Committee. She discussed how and why the committee should be formed based on three factors: Discrimination; Equality- treating everyone the same; and Equity – which is providing equal access, through sometimes unequal services, by removing barriers and providing accommodations. Emphasizing the primary focus as equity, she stated equity means giving people what they need in order to have equal access.

To provide context, a timeline was analyzed to explain the history of exclusion, as to why the committee was necessary, in terms of how Murray has progressed over time:

- 1903 - When Murray City was incorporated;
- 1920 - 19th Amendment, granting women the right to vote;
- 1954 - The implementation of anti-segregation provisions;
- 1967 - The end of laws prohibiting inter-racial marriage;
- 1990 - Americans with Disabilities Act: Established to protect persons from discrimination.
- 2013 - Same sex marriage legalized in Utah.

Ms. Martinez thought it was incredible that same sex marriage was legalized only recently in Utah; as little as just seven years ago. Overall, she said it was important to reflect on the feelings of others who may have been prevented from having equal access, due to systemic legal oppression. She did not want to dwell in the past, but wanted to bring to light how fresh many wounds are for others; and to recognize trauma in marginalized communities about how recent milestones actually are.

She confirmed national legal protections that help with discrimination, but those elements do not lead to equity because local deliberate and enthusiastic inclusion is required. She believed this to mean that additional work at the local community level was essential. She said doing so would help make others feel safe, more included, more welcome; and bring in other active voices that have not been heard, or felt welcomed in more codified pieces of the City.

She agreed Murray's mix of ethnicity is not like Salt Lake City; however, after research she learned that Murray is more diverse than one would think; a graph was shared to reflect those statistics. Differences like nationality; home language- other than English; sexual orientation; and physical disability were listed. She pointed out that one in four of Murray residents face physical disability challenge related to and mobility, cognition, hearing, and vision; and refugees who have very unique challenges.

Functions of the Committee were noted as:

- Outreach
- Listening
- Building Bridges
- Make Recommendations to the City
- Remove Barriers where possible
- Adapt to Practices and Protocols
- Continue Enthusiastic Outreach
- Review Outcomes

Ideally, she said the committee would operate for three to five years, implementing recommendations that would become part of larger plans already exercised in the City; practices would become a typical way that the City would run. Depending on participation the committee would dissolve after reaching specific goals.

Council Comments and Discussions:

- Mr. Cox suggested age discrimination be added to discriminating categories. Ms. Martinez obliged and agreed it was overlooked.
- Mr. Cox asked about the mechanics of committee operations; and wondered if there had been complaints. He asked whether the committee would canvass communities to look for problems; find problems, or research problems. He was very supportive of inclusivity, and diversity, and felt bad if

people were feeling left out. He was not aware of these issues in his district, and if there were existing problems he wanted to know more about that. He questioned what was motivating the proposal, and asked how surveys would be sent out. He inquired whether only certain areas of the City would be surveyed; or if the entire Murray population would be included in questionnaires. He believed Murray City Incorporated, already had excellent Human Resource capabilities; and legal staff to handle any concerns effectively. He thought Murray City as whole, was far ahead of the curve regarding the matter compared to other cities, including Salt Lake City. He requested more clarity to understand exactly why the committee was necessary and how it would function.

- Ms. Martinez thought the survey itself should be created once membership was formed from various communities. She was confident an effective survey could be implemented for the type of information she hoped to gather. She said an on-line survey would also go out by mail to the entire Murray community, and committee members would suggest ways to reach out to those without internet.
- She reported that while knocking on doors during her campaign, she frequently heard from residents that they never thought they would be voting for someone in Murray with her last name; it was a huge deal, knowing she actually won in District #1. She stated that while this does not seem real to some, it was very real to many. She observed while looking at photographs of past mayors located on City Hall hallways, that there were no men of color; she felt this was illustrative of how people could feel left out of leadership. She did not wish to place blame, or say it was purposeful; but believed it was reflective that work must be done to show others they are valued and belong in Murray; even though their family name was not on a wall plaque. She said Murray family names, all sound the same sometimes.
- Mayor Camp appreciated Mr. Cox voicing concerns, and echoed those thoughts about implementing a committee without detailed cause; as the program would be decided by the administration. His hope was to have ample time to ponder both draft ordinances and meet with staff to discuss what the committee would look like, if it was to be approved.
- Ms. Martinez agreed flexibility and comfort level was important to the administration. She affirmed elected officials hear different things within their own communities, where there was often a shift in thought. She said once a survey was complete, more would be realized depending on the results to attain recommendations; it could be a long-term process. She said there was no expectation that massive financially burdened changes would occur immediately. She concluded it was similar to other master plans the City had created that helped achieve goals after attaining information that affect choices going forward.
- Mr. Hales affirmed the proposal indicated committee members would be Murray citizens, and Murray business owners who have interest in Murray. Ms. Martinez confirmed it would also include those who work with refugees and assist Murray refugees with language and transportation barriers that might prevent them from being on the committee. Mr. Hales favored that qualified membership be kept only for those residing in Murray. Ms. Martinez said that was the preference.
- Mr. Cox clarified, committee members that live outside Murray, but work with refugee communities in Murray qualify to be members. Ms. Martinez confirmed.
- Ms. Dominguez said as a woman of color, the board was important to her; in addition growing up in Murray she felt the discrimination. She refuted Mr. Cox and saying that discrimination did happen in District #2 and still does today with relationship to her immediate family. She said discrimination is very real in Murray; and she encouraged that other community members be heard with regard to how they can feel included in government; as well as, in spaces like the Park Center, and farmers market where there is social participation. She echoed Ms. Martinez that while canvassing for her council position, she heard racial comments about her last name and many being fearful in voicing that support for her, due to discrimination.

- Ms. Dominguez agreed if the City could implement a board to promote inclusion in government, to have conversations, it was not about mistakes made in the past, but more about how we can all grow together. Providing such a great opportunity for the City, she asked in order for Mayor Camp to be on board, what might he suggest to help move the process forward, and administer help to get the idea started.
- Mayor Camp was uncertain in responding; and reiterated the reason he requested more time was to look at the proposal, review the information; and meet with staff to evaluate the proposal. He said to appoint people enthusiastic and genuine for the cause; it would take time to find those individuals. First and foremost he wanted to better understand any problems that needed fixing in the City. He realized it was a society-wide problem, however, if there were things the City was not doing he wanted to know about those particular issues first before making suggestions. He wished to meet with Ms. Martinez at a later time to for continued discussion to see if there was common ground in moving forward.
- Mr. Cox said it was heartbreaking to hear that people in this day and age actually said those things to Ms. Martinez, and Ms. Dominguez about their last names. He agreed discrimination exists, which is unfortunate. He said bias has been with man since the dawn of creation, and it would remain until the end of time, and the City can only move forward.
- Mr. Cox observed the timeline Ms. Martinez shared; but concluded it only proved that there were worse times in the past, when looking at the 1600's and up to 1901. Therefore, he said we are making great progress, and need to continue moving that wheel forward.
- Ms. Martinez appreciated perspective through others eyes, and was thankful for the conversation.
- Mr. Cox added they should not be in hurry; and everyone involved should take time to process the information. He said it would be best to ensure legal matters, as well as, communicate well with the Mayor and his administration for proper procedure; he said doing it right, makes the difference.

Announcements: None.

Adjournment: 6:19 p.m.

Pattie Johnson
Council Office Administrator II

ATTACHMENT #1

ORDINANCE NO. _____

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING SECTIONS 12.28.030 AND 12.28.040 OF THE
MURRAY CITY MUNICIPAL CODE RELATED TO GOLF COURSE FEES.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE MURRAY CITY MUNICIPAL COUNCIL:

Section 1. Purpose. The purpose of this ordinance is to amend sections 12.28.030 and 12.28.040 of the Murray City Municipal Code to amend the Golf Course fees.

Section 2. Amendment to sections 12.28.030 and 12.28.040 of the Murray City Municipal Code. Sections 12.28.030 and 12.28.040 of the Murray City Municipal Code shall be amended to read as follows:

12.28.030: GREEN FEES:

The green fees shall be as follows:

| User Type | 9 Holes | 18 Holes |
|--|------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| 10 round punch card | <u>\$130.00</u> <u>\$140.00</u> | n/a |
| Juniors | <u>8.00</u> <u>\$9.00</u> | <u>\$16.00</u> <u>\$18.00</u> |
| Juniors annual pass (age 17 or younger) | <u>\$300.00</u> | |
| Murray High School and Cottonwood High School golf teams | <u>\$6.00</u> | <u>\$12.00</u> |
| Other high school golf teams | <u>\$8.00</u> | <u>\$16.00</u> |
| Regular | <u>15.00</u> <u>\$16.00</u> | <u>30.00</u> <u>\$32.00</u> |
| Seniors (age 65 or older) | <u>12.00</u> <u>\$13.00</u> | <u>24.00</u> <u>\$26.00</u> |

Formatted: Font: Not Bold

All rates above include applicable Sales and Use Tax and are available during times as determined in writing by the Parks and Recreation Director, the Mayor, and the Director of Finance Administration. (Ord. 19-05)

12.28.040: GOLF COURSE OPERATION; RENTALS:

Rental Fees shall be as follows:

| <u>Rental Types</u> | <u>9 Holes</u> | <u>18 Holes</u> |
|--|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Golf clubs | \$ 6 .00 | \$12 .00 |
| Pull cart | <u>\$1 .00</u> | <u>\$2 .00</u> |
| Range ball tokens | <u>\$3 .00</u> | |
| Riding carts (per person) | <u>7 .00</u> <u>\$8.00</u> | <u>14 .00</u> <u>\$16.00</u> |
| Trail fee for private carts used for medical reasons | <u>\$7.00</u> | <u>\$14.00</u> |

All rates above include applicable Sales and Use Tax and are available during times as determined in writing by the Parks and Recreation Director, the Mayor, and the Director of Finance and Administration. (Ord. 19-05)

Section 3. Effective date. This Ordinance shall take effect upon first publication.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the Murray City Municipal Council on
this ____ day of _____, 2020.

MURRAY CITY MUNICIPAL COUNCIL

Rosalba Dominguez, Chair

ATTEST,

Jennifer Kennedy, City Recorder

MAYOR'S ACTION: Approved

DATED this _____ day of _____, 2020.

D. Blair Camp, Mayor

ATTEST:

Jennifer Kennedy, City Recorder

CERTIFICATE OF PUBLICATION

I hereby certify that this Ordinance was published according to law on the _____
day of _____, 2020.

Jennifer Kennedy, City Recorder

ATTACHMENT #2

Diversity and Inclusion Advisory Committee

Discrimination:

The unjust or prejudicial treatment of someone based on age, disability, sexual orientation, status as a parent, religion, nationality, pregnancy, race, color, or gender.

Equality:

Treating everyone the same. Social equality is the belief that all people should be given equal opportunity to take advantage of aspects of society, such as jobs or membership in clubs, and no person should have an advantage over another.

Equity:

Providing equal access through sometimes unequal services by removing barriers and providing accommodations.

The primary focus of the Diversity and Inclusion Advisory Committee is to move the City from one of equality to one of equity.

In order to move forward we must acknowledge the reason such a committee and its work are essential.

The following timeline is a basic outline of the journey of civil rights in America and Utah since the incorporation of Murray as a city.

A History of Exclusion's Slow Shift Through Legally Mandated Inclusion

1903 Murray City Incorporated

1920 19th Amendment Passed - granting white women the right to vote.

1954 Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka, Kansas - Ends "separate but equal" and implements anti-segregation provisions.

1962 Bailey v. Patterson - segregation of transportation facilities deemed unconstitutional

1965 Voting Rights Act - prohibits the denial or restriction of the right to vote

1967 Loving v. Virginia - forbids laws that prohibit inter-racial marriage

1990 Americans with Disabilities Act - protects persons with disabilities from discrimination

2010 Don't Ask Don't Tell Repeal Act - allows openly gay, lesbian and bisexual Americans to serve without discrimination

2013 Kitchen v Herbert - makes same-sex marriage legal in the state of Utah

This timeline demonstrates how recently members of our community have been systemically and legally discriminated against. Years of injustice and violence don't disappear when a Supreme Court ruling is handed down. Years of trauma and learned protective behaviors

persevere even after legal protections are in place. A history of estrangement and fear cannot be overcome by enacting passive equality. It requires deliberate, consistent, and enthusiastic inclusion at the local level.

Tasks of the Committee

The Diversity and Inclusion Advisory Committee will serve to create the structure and focus for this deliberate, consistent, and enthusiastic inclusion by:

Outreach: Identify marginalized communities in the city and invite them to participate in the process.

Survey: Ask questions regarding ease of access of city services and feelings of safety and inclusion at city sponsored events.

Building Bridges: Cultivate relationships, listen and learn.

Making Recommendations: The committee will make recommendations to the city from the communities surveyed.

Remove Barriers: Implement changes to make services more accessible and events more inclusive.

Adapt Practices and Protocols: With the information learned from the recommendations to the city, update practices and protocols within the city.

Continuously and Enthusiastically Reach Out to Marginalized Communities: Outreach must be regular and genuine. This is accomplished by including and integrating members from various communities into the committee.

Reviewing and Measuring Outcomes: Changes implemented compared to recommendations made shall be assessed. The community shall be given a follow up survey to assess access to services and feelings of inclusion and safety at community events. The follow up survey shall be conducted annually after the initial survey to measure results.

Long Term

Ideally this would be a short term (3-5 years) committee. If the committee is successful in gathering information and making recommendations, and the city is able and willing to make the changes to create more equitable services and events, then the committee will see an end to the necessity of their work. But, there is no way to know now if that will be the case, or to foresee what new challenges marginalized communities may face in the future.