



**MURRAY CITY  
COUNCIL / ADMINISTRATION MEETING**

---

The Murray City Municipal Council met jointly with the City Administration for End of Year Service Reports on Monday, January 31, 2010, at 8:00 a.m., in Conference Room #107 at the Murray City Center, 5025 South State Street, Murray, Utah.

**Members in Attendance:**

Jared A. Shaver	Budget & Finance Chair
Darren V. Stam	Council Member
Jim Brass	Council Member
Krista Dunn	Council Member

**Excused:**

Jeff Dredge	Council Member
-------------	----------------

**Others in Attendance:**

Michael Wagstaff	Council Director	Jan Wells	Mayor's Chief of Staff
Dan Snarr	Mayor	Janet Lopez	Office Administrator
Jon Harris	Murray Fire	Gil Rodriguez	Fire Chief
Mike Dykman	Murray Fire	Kevin Potter	Murray Fire
Gabe Johns	Finance	Pat Wilson	Finance Director
Randy Willden	Murray Fire	Tim Tingey	Comm & Econ Dev Dir
Blaine Haacke	General Manager Power	Doug Hill	Public Services Director
Briant Farnsworth	Attorney's Office	Frank Nakamura	City Attorney
GL Critchfield	Attorney's Office	Jenifer Francis	Attorney's Office
Brittany Huff	Attorney's Office	Mark Richardson	Attorney's Office
Mike Terry	Human Resource Director	Brent Davidson	Recorder's Office
Carol Heales	City Recorder		

Mr. Shaver called the meeting to order at 8:05 a.m., and welcomed everyone to the Year End Review. Jeff Dredge was excused for his absence.

**Fire Department - Gil Rodriguez**

## **Administration**

The *Mission* of the Fire Department is to provide fire protection, fire prevention and emergency medical services. He stated that these three responsibilities are very encompassing. Services are provided to the residents, businesses, and also the transient population with a well-trained staff, in an organized and safe manner, at a minimal cost to the City, and to cooperate with other departments. Fire departments are not cheap, the equipment is expensive, and it is manpower heavy.

There are three different areas: administration, suppression, and paramedic/ambulance. These all blend together as the paramedics are firefighters, and firefighters are emergency medical technicians (EMT). Fire prevention is suppression, as well as, administration. It may seem redundant in some places.

*Core services* in administration include the officers: the Fire Chief, and four Battalion Chiefs. As Chief, he expressed his responsibility for everything that occurs in the fire department. Together the officers oversee department budget and expenditures; oversee all employees of the fire department; and provide measures necessary to the prevention and extinguishing of fires, the protection of life and property. The department responds to, operates in, or commands emergency incidents as required and/or assigned. They have to be prepared for the things that don't happen very often. This takes a lot of training.

They coordinate overall training efforts of the department, provide oversight and coordination of scheduling, selection, evaluation and deployment of the department personnel. Administration duties include recruiting and hiring personnel, coordinating fire prevention inspections, and maintaining a working knowledge of fire codes and ordinances.

Services include formulating long and short-range plans and procedures, as well as Standard Operating Guidelines (SOG's). This document is constantly changing and must be updated with additions, and reviewed. They coordinate with other departments and agencies, including interlocal agreements with city, county, state and local governments. The fire administration ensures compliance with all city rules, regulations, and policies. They work with the building department on fire prevention, and fire protection. The officers investigate the origin of fires, and circumstances of fires resulting in loss of life, injury or damage to property.

Mr. Shaver asked if fire investigation or arson detection is done in-house. The Chief responded that it is completed by the Fire Marshall and Deputy Fire Marshall in substantial fires. All officers know the fundamentals of fire investigation. Russ Groves is voice trained for evaluating stress during interviews.

The administration is active in budgeting, payroll, purchasing and technical support. Emergency management is a big part of the fire department duties. All apparatus maintenance, upgrades, planning, and purchasing are overseen for fire prevention programs. An ambulance is about \$150,000, and apparatus runs from \$600,000 to a million dollars. These are hard items to ask for. More leasing has been done.

Reports on fire, medical, and personnel are becoming more prevalent every day. On deployment of personnel, Fire operates with 18 people per shift, if fully staffed. This means no one is hurt, on vacation, and no one is in training. There are four people on the fire trucks, and

two people on each ambulance. We can drop down to three on an apparatus, but less than that, one ambulance will be taken out of service, the Fire Chief explained.

Some of the core services of the fire prevention are to manage the Community Emergency Response Teams (CERT), CPR, first aid, and special events. CERT classes may have from 15 to 30 participants. Mr. Brass referred to a speech made by Chief Rodriguez, when he made the point that if there is a major earthquake or disaster, fire and police won't be going to homes. They will be in schools, hospitals, and malls where there is the largest concentration of people. The CERT teams have the level of training in the neighborhoods that may make a big difference. It is critical. The Chief stated that the emergency will happen, and it won't be at the most convenient time. He commented that fire and police are like an insurance policy, you hate to have to pay for it, but you love it when you need them and they are there to help.

*Inputs* show the staffing in administration, which is steady at seven. The seasonal are the cadets, which is not an expensive program. Now, some are full time in fire departments here, and in other cities.

*Outputs* in fire prevention include, building inspections and business license inspection, plan reviews and fire sprinkler reviews and inspections, investigations, classes, and events. There are a number of member organizations: Metro Fire, Salt Lake Valley Fire Alliance (all departments in Salt Lake County), Utah State Fire Chiefs Association, Greater Salt Lake Chief Fire Officer Association, Valley Emergency Communication Center (VECC), and the Joint Council of Fire Service Organization, which considers legislative issues. The Chief mentioned a number of other organizations the department participates with, and detailed the positions he currently holds: Second Vice Chair of Metro Fire, Vice Chair of the Utah State Fire Chiefs, and a Board Member of the Intrastate Mutual Aid. Chief Rodriguez was the past chair for three other organizations.

Fire prevention programs include the Safety Fair, Fire Prevention Week, CERT, Muscular Dystrophy, Angel's Hands Foundation, and the National Fallen Firefighters.

*Issues and trends* show that fire service is constantly changing, with more and more restrictions and guidelines to dictate how business is done. NFPA standards are routinely updated and it is difficult to keep current. Utah is an OSHA state and we currently are not meeting all of the standards. Apparatus and vehicle replacement are difficult because of the high cost of apparatus and lack of a replacement program. The Fire Department budget is primarily labor. Most all other expenses are recurring, maintaining office space, seven buildings, as well as, all equipment and vehicles.

Mr. Shaver asked if there are state or national standards as to how long equipment should be used. The Chief responded that there is only a general rule of 10 years service. With three stations replacement would be every five years. The other measurement is the cost of maintenance.

*Possible 5%* reductions are very difficult. The Chief pointed out that he has lowered the budgets in books, and travel. There is not much travel in fire. They go to the state chiefs' conference in St. George, taking one car, and stay at a private home. The national fire academy is covered except for the meal ticket, and these are the only travel items budgeted. They would actually like to go to more functions that would provide additional expertise. Equipment maintenance is hard to lower, due to older vehicles that may need repairs.

Education and training are lower because most of the training is in state. The CERT program can be lowered by holding fewer classes. He stated his reluctance to do this, because of the value of having the community involved. Besides labor there is not a lot in the budget. His concern is in delaying the vehicle and equipment purchases. By putting it off, then there will be multiple vehicle needs, and the vehicle maintenance line item will need increasing. We are falling below NFPA and OSHA standards. It is difficult to administer 54 multi-disciplined line personnel, with four battalion chiefs. With paramedics, EMTs, swift water rescue, hazmat, and special operations, it is hard to oversee.

Mr. Shaver asked about all the different certifications, and if it requires a salary adjustment when a staff member receives a new certification. Chief Rodriguez stated that the only certifications requiring a pay increase is that of the paramedic. Captains and engineers also get greater pay.

Mr. Shaver asked if there are fire department employees who are at retirement level. The Chief responded that nine people have more than 20 years in, and two that are definitely thinking of retirement. Keeping the passion for the service is a difficult thing to duplicate.

Mr. Brass commented that the 5% number is what everyone is working toward. He explained that in 2008 the City had \$15,288,000 in sales tax revenue, in 2010 that dropped to \$12,293,000. That is \$3 million lost, and the City is running below that right now. The guaranteed floor is \$12.2 million, but that will be discontinued in two years. If sales tax continues to drop, then we will have a real issue. The constitution provides for a balanced budget and there is just not enough money. We are all looking at each line item, however, in addition to that, we need to look at how we do business. Is there a better way of doing business that doesn't mean cutting people? Could it be a change in philosophy?

Chief Rodriguez informed the Council that fire has changed the way business is done, by how the ambulance service is run, to how the vehicles are staffed. If personnel is down, staffing on the third ambulance will be changed, and we adjust staff by time of day. The chief shared his feelings about the passion for fire fighting and how he is afraid that some of that is being lost with new younger recruits.

Mr. Brass explained that the quasi governmental agencies, like VECC, Central Valley, UTOPIA and others do not feel the strain of budgets. They plan to give raises and make other commitments, however, all of that comes from the City monies. It is tough for the Council, to not have the ability to give raises, and having the City employees wonder if there will be layoffs. It is wearing, but regrettably, it is where we are. As a City, philosophically, we are trying to grow out of it, by bringing in new businesses, and getting new buildings built. We do have until June 30 and we will not have to react until late April. We can come up with ideas, but what we are asking is to look around, be creative. The Chief stated that he also lives in Murray, therefore, he takes things very personally. When he is around town, there is a difference in Murray, and what we have to offer. Mr. Brass assured him that we do not want to jeopardize public safety in any way. The Chief remarked that his department is very big on customer service. The guys help citizens in whatever way they can.

Mr. Shaver stated that Murray will still have the best service available and a way will be found to make that happen.

Chief Rodriguez referred to the fire department groups, and added that Murray has a well-respected department. Many younger guys did not think fire would be affected by the recession, and he has seen a change from "this isn't fair" to "thank you for a job."

Ms. Dunn mentioned that a couple of years ago, when the Council first had to ask all of the departments for a 5% cut, she remembers well that Chief Rodriguez came back to the Council with a decrease of 9.5%. She very much appreciated his support, the innovation, and idea that he was willing to cut back as much as possible. She realizes it makes 5% now, even more difficult. She continued, stating that he had instituted a new pilot program on staffing, with the option to let the Council know if it did not work, and because he never returned to the Council, it must have been successful. The Chief noted the difficulty in selling the decreases to the personnel. Mr. Stam was pleased to hear that some of the staff is happy to have a job.

Also affected by budget cuts are the mutual aid and other cooperative agreements that may suffer for not being able to deliver promised resources. We do rely heavily on mutual aid. This is affected when we cut way, way back, and safety could be jeopardized. It is impossible to cut 5% without seriously cutting personnel. He commented that there is minimal office staff. He has Ms. Lloyd, a computer specialist, and a part time receptionist just to cover lunches.

A 5% reduction would come from the following: \$60,000 from non personnel cuts; \$290,000 would need to come from our labor force, \$80,000 in overtime, and \$210,000 in lost employees. That could be retirements or layoffs, and anytime we have fewer employees we will experience a strain on service delivery. We cannot go so low that the safety of our personnel is compromised. We work hard on staff morale, and it will be affected with significant cuts.

### **Suppression**

The Chief commented that administration has bled into suppression, but there are some specific issues. These are the guys that stabilize property. The *core services* include: fire suppression, special operations, advanced life support (ALS), emergency medical response, emergency management, training, public education, fire prevention, and other services.

In suppression *core services* are: fire suppression, fire response, hazardous materials, emergency ordinance disposal (EOD), mutual/auto aid response (valley & statewide), and a metro incident management team. This is a group that gets together four to five times a year to train for something big. It includes all the departments except Metro and Salt Lake City.

Some of the special operations are: water/ice rescue, trench rescue, confined space, rope rescue, and metro urban search and rescue (USAR). Water and ice rescue was initiated by Murray Fire. We are still cutting edge.

Training and Certifications include: fire, EMS, special operations, incident command, management/leadership, metro/multi agency, alliance/multi agency, health and safety, City employees (ICS, CERT, First Aid, CPR), and community training.

Emergency Management consists of the following services: emergency operations center management, Citywide emergency operations plan development and implementation, City staff incident command training, grant writing and administration, maintain and operate emergency AM radio, coordinate amateur radio operators, and CERT management.

Miscellaneous services include: company business inspections, hydrant inspection and maintenance, station maintenance, equipment maintenance, pre incident fire and hazardous materials planning, and target hazard identification and inspections.

*Inputs* show that the department is down by two employees for a \$92,000 reduction.

*Outputs* indicate that there have been fewer calls for service this year. The Chief feels this directly reflects the economy with people being a little more reluctant to call 911 for service. Training hours for non medical, medical, and administrative are fairly consistent.

*Outputs* in suppression include City liaison with a list of 11 external organizations. Staff in suppression are four battalion chiefs, nine captains, and 45 line firefighters. Projects and programs are the same as in administration.

*Issues and trends* include continuing apparatus and equipment maintenance, demands of multi-discipline training, changing physical environment, external policy demands, physical and psychological demands on personnel, maintaining appropriate staffing levels, and health and safety of personnel. There is an expectation that fire will respond to "all hazard" situations, with professionalism, customer service, and a high level of multi-certification requirements.

*Budget reductions* in suppression are in overtime, books and subscriptions, equipment maintenance, vehicle maintenance, and building maintenance. Chief Rodriguez is leery of cutting the maintenance items because they do need properly working equipment, and apparatus on the road. There is an agreement with Metro to use one of their ambulances or trucks if we are down. When the department does use apparatus from someone else, they are usually back-up engines, and we are really glad to get back into ours.

Mr. Shaver asked where we get fuel. The Chief said they go to the City shops, power, or highway patrol. It is all tracked through public works. We do have some control over utility costs, so we try to conserve. Again, the budget is labor intensive. Mr. Shaver questioned the equipment costs for WMD and HLS. Mr. Willden explained that those are grants and the numbers will change from year to year.

A 5% reduction would mean: reduced staffing, reduced response capability, limited training opportunities, increased equipment down time, inability to purchase or replace necessary equipment, loss of revenue to ambulance service, safety concerns and liability, and the inability to meet mutual/auto aid agreements. The ambulances stay very busy. These items will also apply to ambulance service.

### **Paramedics/Ambulance**

Mr. Shaver mentioned a stolen car incident on his street where 12 emergency or police vehicles showed up. He feels that sometimes we overdo response. The Chief clarified that there have been some changes in response, historically, the closest unit would go, and that was usually a fire engine, with all EMT or paramedic personnel, then an ambulance would show up. If the police have a potential for medical needs, they call the ambulance service. Some calls require everybody, however, the ambulance has given the department help in clearing calls, and getting unnecessary people out.

The Paramedics/Ambulance *Core Services* is a subset of the Fire Department's mission "to provide emergency medical services (EMS) to the residential and business population of the City." The essential functions of EMS are triage, treatment, transportation of sick and injured persons. EMS is a comprehensive system including rapid response, intervention, stabilization, and transportation to a definitive care facility, if needed.

Ms. Dunn asked if we train our own people. The Chief responded that we have personnel who are trainers, therefore, we are lucky to do our own training. The paramedics are a very complex service with so many certifications, responsibilities, and protocols to follow. It's a tough job but they do it with a smile.

The *inputs* show an increase in staff in FY2009-2010, when the ambulance personnel was hired.

*Outputs* show a peak in medical calls in FY 2008-2009, then they began to taper off. Ambulance transports were for part of the year in fiscal '08-09, and then increased the following year.

Mr. Stam asked about ambulance revenue in comparison to expense. The Chief responded that the ambulance service is paying for itself. He would like it to be a greater revenue source, however, he does confirm that the service is far better than what was available before. These men are here for a career. They are firefighters, not there as a stepping stone to get on the fire department. They are passionate about it.

Chief Rodriguez named 12 external organizations that the paramedic/ambulance service interfaces with. There are one battalion chief and 34 paramedic/firefighters, with a computer support person, and a medical director.

Projects and programs were detailed, and the *trends* show that nationally, ambulance service rates are increasing to cover the cost of providing ambulance service. Increasing rates barely maintain existing systems and are not able to improve the system. Base fees for ambulance service are set by the Utah State Bureau of Emergency Medical Services. Fees for medical equipment & supplies are billed at "reasonable & customary" rates. The rates also must compensate for bad debts, and the write off for Medicare and Medicaid, which pay at much lower rates.

There is continued pressure from Medicare and Medicaid to reduce reimbursements for ambulance services, and we see increasing numbers of uninsured individuals using ambulance services. Changing medical standards require additional training and equipment, ie. STEMI and hypothermic resuscitation. Unfortunately, there are limited or no grant funds to meet needs.

The intent of the Murray City Council and the Fire Department as supported by the Council's Letter of Intent, and approved in the 2007-2008 Municipal Budget, was to provide the fire department capability to perform the essential EMS functions of triage, treatment, and transportation of sick and injured persons within Murray. Our ability to quickly respond to emergency calls makes a difference in life and death situations and our ability to transport victims to an appropriate facility with a high level of care improves medical outcomes. We provide excellent customer service through improved continuity of patient care, and meet or exceed the level of care provided by surrounding communities. The Chief explained that our fire departments are ideally located for timely response, and most people are taken to Intermountain Medical Center (IMC). However, patients will be taken to any hospital they request, around the valley. Our paramedics provide the service to the patients and to their family members.

Explanatory factors include the following facts:

- ALS Ambulance service began January 1, 2009
- 2009 Medical Calls –3801
- 2009 Ambulance Transports –2159 (57%)
- 2009 Revenues -\$659,002.29 (four month revenue lag)
- 2010 Medical Calls –3565

- 2010 Ambulance Transports –2037 (57%) estimated
- 2010 Revenues -\$900,000 estimated

Our reporting to State BEMS indicates an estimated break even of revenues and expenses (within 15 calls), the Chief expressed. He anticipates negative to flat call growth with increasing pressure on revenue collection, and seeks to anticipate the capital equipment replacement.

In planning for *budget reductions*, paramedics and suppression must be taken together, because the personnel is the same. Overtime cuts are anticipated at \$50,000, and fuel decreases are \$3,000, education and training cuts of \$2,000, paramedic supplies down \$10,000, and ambulance operations down by \$20,000. These numbers are based on the previous year trend.

Cuts will reduce training opportunities. This field changes constantly and the certifications are vital. He cannot staff the third ambulance in off hours, and reduce the overtime pay. In a big bind, he can shut down one ambulance for 24 hours. However, we don't want to reduce so much that there is lost revenue. It will limit our operational readiness if we do not have the necessary equipment available. If there are fewer matching funds, participation in grant opportunities may be limited. We can do away with public education week, however, that goes a long way in educating citizens. Paramedic training has been cut down.

Mr. Shaver asked if the Chief has a five year forecast on where he would like to be. He does have both the financial plan and a service plan. Many activities are not with a cost, such as the entities the fire department works with. Mr. Shaver asked about replacement of apparatus so that the Council can look further down the road. The Chief said that he would like to have \$250,000 per year set aside for a vehicle replacement program. One vehicle is a 2009, then there is a 2007, and others have well more than 100,000 miles on them. These will need replacement. He would like to have battalion chiefs back on a shift, which is another person, but it saves on vehicles. A concern is that the air packs are not OSHA compliant. This is an expense. Total replacement would be between \$250,000 and \$300,000. That is for 36. Not meeting OSHA means that we have no capability for sharing air. Working with other departments is hard.

Mr. Stam represents Murray on VECC, and he would like to be able to talk about what expectation's Murray has from them. The Chief said that he likes the fact that Dave Sanderson has taken over the budget, and he feels that will clean things up.

### **Community and Economic Development - Tim Tingey**

Mr. Tingey reviewed his organizational staff, including RDA, naming staff members: Ray Christensen, Senior Planner; Susan Dewey, Associate Planner; Chad Wilkinson, Community Development Planner; office support, zoning enforcement, and CDBG staff.

The department *mission statement* was developed when the strategic planning was done a few years prior and they feel strongly about being a "can do" department. The emphasis is on contributing to the enhancement and prosperity of our community through overseeing orderly growth and development.



*Core services* are to serve customers, conduct long range planning, deal with the general plan and the future related to planning, economic development, job creation, retention and expansion, prosperity enhancement, and quality of life protection. Redevelopment is a large part of services, creating, managing and implementing zoning, and code enforcement, which focuses on zoning enforcement related to uses and codes. The Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program is administered through this department.

The department supports a number of advisory board committees in the City, including the: Planning Commission, Board of Adjustment, RDA, Downtown Design Review Committee, Site Plan Review Committee, and a future Economic Development Coordination Committee.

He feels the customers are the citizens, elected officials, businesses, and others, and Mr. Tingey feels strongly that it is important to serve and meet the needs of the customers.

*Inputs* show a steady staff of five members, with two seasonal. In 2008 two departments were merged into one, maintaining the same staffing. One seasonal was dropped and then one picked up in 2010, which is covered by CDBG funding.

Labor numbers indicate a substantial increase in 2008, with two payouts, one retirement and one resignation. Fiscal year 2009 shows a large decrease, accounted for by the two salaries mentioned, and also police code enforcement that was shifted into the police budget.

Operating expense stayed fairly consistent, with some reductions last year for professional services. There was money budgeted for the Taylorsville Bus Rapid Transit in FY 2009, which was reduced along with training, and weed control.

The program revenue of \$25,000 is what comes in for land use applications. Most communities do not cover that.

*Outputs* show that 2008 had some significant numbers, which show the fluctuation in the economy going into 2009. It went back up in 2010 with a lot of applications taken to the Planning Commission and Board of Adjustments. Variance and conditional use permit requests were up, and subdivisions went down, and then back up again.

Measuring outputs by square footage, you can see drops in 2009 and increases in 2010. Once the hospital was completed there were significant drops. Zoning enforcement complaints went up in 2010, and we instigated some by dealing with some land use applications. Business license reviews went up in 2009, but dropped in 2010, which we conduct from a land use perspective. Final inspections went up also.

Mr. Shaver asked what deferral agreements are. Mr. Tingey responded that they are approved applications involving landscaping or pavement work that cannot be completed due to weather. Security must be provided, however, the work can be postponed.

Other outputs concern a busy couple of years in drafting ordinances. A major mixed-use zoning ordinance was drafted completely in-house, including adopting the mixed-use area, in February of 2010. This was a significant process, and took a considerable amount of time. It

was taken to the public three different times for input. It included some study sessions with the Planning Commission and modifications through the process.

Six other ordinance changes were facilitated, and the Murray City Center ordinance has taken considerable work. The department has developed a document that provides additional direction on processes and departmental policy on how to proceed on issues not clearly defined in the City Code. There has been work in negotiating agreements for property acquisition in the downtown area. The Popular Street home was purchased and a lease agreement was developed with NeighborWorks to coordinate Murray activities. Environmental review efforts were completed on two homes and the Hoffman building is under review now. His department was the liaison between the 2010 Census and the City, Mr. Tingey explained. Additionally, there are a significant number of meetings that are participated in for land use processes.

Other activities in the department include the economic symposium with 65 attendees, economic development efforts, with a baseline assessment and marketing materials development. They respond to EDCU requests for information on businesses coming to Utah. Some do not fit our community, such as a 200,000 square foot manufacturing facility, however, professional office or retail proposals do get our response, and a submittal for information is sent. EDCU grants have been written for help in marketing and special event meetings, he has attended the ICSC convention, and is continuing work on the Downtown Master Plan process. Drafting the ordinances, the design guidelines, working with the public open houses, and working toward the expansion of the Central Business District has made this a huge undertaking.

As the RDA the Council is fully aware of activities in the Fireclay development area agreement modifications, Central Business District tax increment financing, Quality Oil site, Fireclay redevelopment area street network and TOD guideline modifications, November 1 submittal, and the Hoffman building demolition. The asbestos will have to be cleaned up prior to tearing down the building, which should happen in the next four to six weeks.

CDBG programs include the NeighborWorks partnership, serving on the NeighborWorks Board of Directors and a Murray Advisory committee. The application process has changed to become more of a web-based approach. The analysis of impediments for the Salt Lake County consolidated plan for Fair Housing was participated in, and CDBG training was attended. The staff adopted a monitoring and procedure policy that will guide the CDBG program and sub-recipients, with on site monitoring. The first landlord housing symposium was held with about 35 in attendance. An ongoing technical assistance workshop was hosted for the CDBG application process.

*Explanatory factors:* The department has been diligent in pursuing creation of plans to affect the future of the community. This has included drafting a new Mixed Use ordinance, multiple revisions to City land use ordinances, more "in house" review of development plans for the Fireclay Area and creation of a vision, new ordinance, and extension of the redevelopment area for the downtown. This has consumed a considerable amount of staff time and capacity over the past year. Department staff has strived to be more focused on effective and excellent customer service and has worked to be very responsive to the public on issues. There has been a greater emphasis on code compliance, with more follow up. Each land use application (130 last year) that is processed involves extensive analysis by staff including site visits, creation of GIS mapping and extensive staff reports to assist the City Council and Land Use

committees in making decisions.

*Issues and trends:* Mr. Tingey explained that now that the downtown area ordinance is close to being adopted, he feels the department focus will be extensive recruitment. He is already working with developers that have interest. They will be proactive in that area, and in Fireclay. Staff expertise will increase to make sure that proposed development meets the standards that will be adopted. The demand on the department has not slowed and will continue to expand. CDBG will be evaluated to see if Murray can become an entitlement program if the minimum population mark is hit. At 50,000 people this will be an issue. Long range and general planning will need to be considered in the next couple of years, much will be done in-house, rather than using a consultant.

Possible 5% budget reductions are being considered in the areas marked by an asterisk on the slide. It will be decreased in: temporary employees, no intern; public notices, depending on what happens with land use applications; travel, relying more on RDA money for travel; office supplies and professional will take minor reductions. Reductions from the Chamber of Commerce were taken in 2011, and we will adjust again by \$2,000. There has been some communication with them and they feel it will not significantly hurt their service. The big reduction is planned from the Utah Economic Development Corporation of Utah. They have been funded at more than \$20,000 for years and years, and Mr. Tingey is proposing a \$12,000 reduction now. The reason for this is that Murray has not had success from the request for information proposals that have been filed. Looking at the funding from other communities show that Murray's rate is higher than others with less population. This is a concern. Some of the annual meetings look as if costs could be reduced, yet these meetings seem to get more extravagant each year. Last year an expensive speaker was brought in, that was not done in the past. We are not getting a lot out of the relationship.

Ms. Dunn commented that EDCU seems to look for huge corporations that can easily locate in new areas that don't require redevelopment. In Murray, it would take redevelopment to have larger corporations. Mr. Shaver feels that if we are not seeing a return on investment, then the dollars should be allocated elsewhere for something that would be more advantageous to Murray. Mr. Tingey agreed with that idea, and added that EDCU has opened a California office, from which he has not seen fruit.

Mr. Tingey mentioned a slight reduction in education and training funding, however, again, he may rely on RDA money for that. A small decrease is seen in the Planning Commission line item, and that budgeted amount is if every commissioner attended every meeting. Some do have to be excused from time to time and they are not paid then. EDCU grant money has been scaled back somewhat.

Krista expressed that economic development is the only area where the City can really increase revenue. Mr. Brass said that we need to really look at whom we want to target. If there are organizations that we would specifically like to have in the Murray downtown, then we need to go after them. He stated that the trip to Idaho was very informative, and the City needs to sit down and find out what companies really need to come here. Maybe we can do it, or maybe we cannot. Mr. Tingey said that local development firms should be met with to let them know what we have. Mr. Shaver said that we cannot expect our police, fire, and public service departments to be money makers, but there are things we need to invest in that will create that return.

Following a short break the meeting resumed at 10:00 a.m.

### **Attorney's Office - Frank Nakamura**

Mr. Nakamura introduced his staff stating that in his opinion they are the best in the state. Jen Francis, Office Manager; Briant Farnsworth, does a lot of work for the power department; G.L. Critchfield, the land use expert; Mark Richardson, prosecutor; Brittany Huff, prosecutor, who will talk about the Justice Court.

The *mission* is to provide the highest legal representation to our client. The issue is who is our client. The office serves various roles and clients: City, Mayor, Council, departments, individual employees, and the public. One of their roles is to provide compliance with federal, state, and local laws. On the prosecution side, they do prosecute all misdemeanor violations within the city limits. Even though they represent the City, they must be fair with the defendants under constitutional rights, and also citizens and victims.

They are divided into two divisions: civil and prosecution.

### **Civil**

*Core services* include acting as: advisor, balancing different interests; advocate, representing a position; negotiator, dealing with agreements, contracts and other parties; intermediary, reconciling divergent interests; evaluator, giving written or verbal opinions; legal system duty, with processes to follow and limitations on government, protecting personal and property rights. Mr. Nakamura stressed that court is not a good way to handle disagreements, it is expensive and takes a long time.

*Inputs* show a reduction in personnel, although it is mainly an accounting entry, matching the prosecution expenses with court revenue. Those who work in the court show up in the criminal budget. Overall, the attorney's office personnel remains status quo.

*Outputs* show an allocation of the work done to the various City funds. Work for enterprise fund, RDA, and general fund. His work includes preparation and advice on ordinances and resolutions; property acquisitions for all departments in the City, procurement, environment assessments, title work, and monitoring litigation. Mr. Nakamura advises human resources on employment issues, and works on matters before administrative agencies, such as the tax commission, IRA, department of environmental quality, etc. He reviews and prepares agreements on behalf of the City, and the RDA. They are anticipating more work with the RDA as the extension of the downtown area is completed, and Fireclay. Depositions on employees are attended for discovery. These hours are reimbursed to the general fund.

Mr. Critchfield pointed out the general fund work that he does is related to community and economic development, the recorder's office, and various other departments. In community development he represents the Planning Commission, Board of Adjustment, and over the last 13 years he has attended every meeting except five, which is two per month on planning, and one a month on adjustment. He said the worst Planning Commission meeting was very contentious and went to 11:30 p.m., when he was out of town, and Mr. Nakamura attended. There are pending issues on the downtown district, and litigation pending on a sign near I15.

One area the City tries to avoid is in "takings." The government is not allowed to take private property without just compensation. Cases are lurking at every decision in community development. A new process is in place with the ombudsman, who is able to mediate land use matters. Murray works hard to keep a good relationship with that office. There are zoning enforcement issues that must be worked out very delicately.

The Recorder's Office, and business licensing is part of the attorney's representation responsibilities. Alcohol and special event permits, are also dealt with. These usually come up out of the normal course of business, and one thing that is important is to work within legal deadlines. They work closely with the State Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control. Procurement and the bid process necessitate legal involvement.

Water and sewer has a lawsuit pending regarding a water line in a private development. An enormous cost could be involved in this issue. Water rights' matters come up, and it is vital to get these issues correct.

Frequent involvement in Government Records Access and Management Act (GRAMA) issues come from police, recorder's, fire, and whether particular records can be released. Another level has been added with the paramedics and HIPPA. GRAMA has a 10-day deadline, so it must be addressed promptly. Through the year the City probably gets 10 to 15 subpoenas, which is a request for records from the attorney's office. Usually, it does not involve Murray's office, and they typically respond with a motion to have the judge decide whether it is too private to release.

There are institutional controls on the Smelter Site, with ongoing issues, such as an open review of Costco, when they wanted to move their gas tanks. Now there is the same thing with FrontRunner, because anytime dirt is turned on that site the City must know about it.

Prosecution for G.L. and Mr. Farnsworth are to advise the court on the civil side without overlapping.

Mr. Farnsworth commented that a lot of what he does is work with the power department. Power issues are unique from other contracts in the City. He does review and draft the agreements for power, and includes everything from rebuilding a substation, to sale and purchase of power resources. Because federal regulations are involved, another layer of complications is added. There are at least three more regulatory agencies that govern what power can and cannot do. He also stated that he works closely with UAMPS, which coordinates many of the different projects we are involved in. Additionally, we sell power through them. Impact fees charged must be according to state statutes. Mr. Farnsworth attends the Power Advisory Board meetings. Some surplus property has been sold to UTA for FrontRunner.

The library fund is part of Mr. Farnsworth responsibility, drafting and advising on contracts, state reporting, grants, and endowment work. There are tort claims, property damage or personal injury claims, that must be handled on behalf of the City. These claims seem to be trending upward. The majority of these are car accidents or slip and fall incidents. Others involve injury on City equipment, the water slide, jungle gym, and stepping into manholes.

Ms. Francis takes the claims, checks on the validity, and gets the department's

viewpoint, then reviews the claim prior to sending it to the attorney. She now has a Medicare report requirement if anyone is on Medicare. Mr. Nakamura noted that Ms. Francis has been really good on automobile accidents, working with the insurance companies, appraisers, injured person, and has done a good job in negotiating those with a number of releases and cases resolved. Mr. Farnsworth has had to defend some of these unreasonable claims in court. One is in litigation now. Usually, insurance companies will work with us, but in these cases, where our police cars were hit, the insurance companies are not willing to settle. We have had to file lawsuits and the City is pursuing those now.

Mr. Shaver asked if the attorneys' time is compensated by the court when we are in pursuit of a claim. Mr. Nakamura has never had the court award attorney's fees even if we are the prevailing party, court costs are awarded. He insisted that court is not a good way to resolve issues. The parties know the case best and are in the best position to resolve the matters, court is expensive and takes a lot of time. There was some discussion about why attorney fees are not awarded, and if it is because they are compensated by the City.

Mr. Farnsworth noted that they get accident reports from the Park Center, which are tracked. Some claims have gone further, with a settlement or defense necessary. The power department has had a number of claims against them for power surges, or irregularities. These have not had to go to court. He has also worked on collections in financial billing on storm water fees in the annexed area. In the end, litigation was necessary on about 12 cases. There are two hotels that habitually fail to pay the transient room tax. These were settled prior to court action. He also works with finance to review the garnishments processed through the City. They have worked with court contracts and the bailiffs. They will also work with the court to track and prosecute claims on bail forfeitures. They have six months to rectify that, by either bringing the defendant in or paying the bond. None of these have required litigation.

Mr. Farnsworth described a case that was just recently dismissed. It was a 1983 civil rights claim against a police officer for excessive force or search and seizure. Even if the claim is frivolous, it takes a long time and must be defended. The officer, and the City are both defended in those cases.

Recently, advice on fire contracts, and policy and procedure reviews have been done. An opinion was given on the firefighters use of social media. Other departments have had issues with posting things they have seen on calls to FaceBook. He has also dealt with "Do Not Resuscitate" orders. It is like a Living Will, and we felt that we could not track all of those for patrons or people the paramedic's assist. A legal opinion was issued following research on the topic.

Our attorneys now attend the valley wide Chief's meeting, as most jurisdictions have their attorneys attend who represent the police, to discuss the issues involving police. One trend is that pawn shops are purchasing gold from people, and how police should respond when people openly carry weapons. They help the Mayor with various issues, such as, drafting the proclamation for a local emergency, which will protect the City from claims that did arise after the flood.

Brittany Huff explained that the prosecution attorneys do only about 10% non court issues. The rest of the time is spent in court prosecuting for the City.

Mr. Nakamura informed the Council that a lot of work is done with state, federal, and county agencies. His office is the liaison with these entities. He will be working with Sim Gills' office on issues related to agreements with Salt Lake County. He works on projects and programs with finance, such as the risk program, making some improvements on that, and new software will be used to monitor the claims from various departments.

*Issues and trends* are seen in tort claims, employment, and land use. Mr. Critchfield said that when things are going well economically, people perceive the City stalling their project as a cost of doing business, however, when the economy is down, litigation becomes the means of choice for solving issues. The counterbalance is that there are fewer applications.

Tort claims are increasing and an unwillingness to negotiate goes with it. Legal claims may cause the city to incur some costs and need expertise to assist if issues arise with UTOPIA and UIA.

Mr. Nakamura also foresees additional work with RDA, if the central business district RDA is extended, and he believes it will be. He indicated he is looking forward to a lot of activity in the downtown, and also in Fireclay.

Addressing *budget explanatory* factors, Mr. Nakamura explained that he uses professional services because sometimes there are conflicts, especially in employment cases. He needs outside counsel to handle or investigate matters, when there are the hearing board, employee, and the City. Outside counsel is used for litigation, because these firms are geared up for litigation and the City is not. If something could cause serious economic harm to the City, we go outside. The professional services budget is based on what has been used in the past.

Possible *5% budget reductions* must come from the personnel line items, Ms. Francis commented. All the other categories have been scrutinized and nothing would add up to the 5% asked for. The civil side would mean reduction in office management staff.

### **Prosecution**

The *core service* is criminal prosecution. This requires a team of prosecutors and support staff working together with crime victims, witnesses and the justice system to prosecute misdemeanors within the City's jurisdiction. The term system is very important, as the attorney's office is one part of that system.

*Inputs* include four legal techs and two prosecuting attorneys. Because of the number of cases, the workload is tailored to the personnel. A loss of an attorney or tech would mean a requirement to fill the gap. When the prosecutors go to court, the things that are learned there can only be learned in court. Things are not taught in any class. It takes a prosecutor probably one to two years to learn the process. It takes a lot of time to teach this. We have two prosecutors who are both blood thirsty and ethical, which helps in the process. It is a big complicated system, Mr. Nakamura stated.

The staffing costs have gone up here because the prosecuting attorneys have been moved out of civil and into the prosecution to match up with court revenue. Overall the

attorney's budget is status quo.

Ms. Francis detailed that in addition to the two attorneys there are three full time and one part time support staff, legal administrators, who manage the case files. The evidence and information are gathered to prosecute. The police reports and toxicology reports are gathered to make sure the file is complete, having all the evidence. There are 12 court clerks. This all has to be distributed to the defense. Sometimes cases must be screened with the police to make sure there is enough evidence to go to court.

Ms. Huff stated that one legal tech does everything for district court, screening, and she sends discovery to the defense. Another legal tech does all trials and hearings. Before trial this must be reviewed to make sure all evidence is in the file for the attorney, to work with the victims and officers. There is no second chance. There are two legal techs that make new files. They must obtain the rap sheet from different sources, pull driver license and see if there are priors.

Ms. Huff said that Mark Richardson is on the domestic violence calendar, and she handles the DUI calendar. She showed a thick file for one DUI case, and detailed the information in that file including: the citation, note page, blood sample, pretrial information, drivers license, an accident report if appropriate, witness statements, fire or police reports, proof that the paramedic is certified to take blood for DUI, priors, court dates, discovery, etc. The techs up front put together this information.

Ms. Huff explained the calendars that she and Mr. Richardson work on. Each one is in court three to four times a week. Each calendar is either for morning or afternoon. There are about 50 to 60 files per calendar. They must speak with every single person on the calendar. The defendant tells the attorney the reasons they are innocent, and what they think is legal justification. Once the Judge takes the bench, they represent the City, and tell the Judge if there are priors, facts of the case, the reason for the offer, and the city's recommendation on sentencing. When they plead guilty there is paperwork, and the "rights" sheet must be filed out. If there are no priors they can offer a great deal, and then explain to the Judge, and the Judge must accept it. Statutes are always changing and we must be aware of that. The Chief has two really good bailiffs. Sometimes there are serious gang members coming in from prison transport with two armed guards with them. They can go to jail on our case, Ms. Huff reported.

She further pointed out that the 50 to 60 cases are for pre trials, then bench trials take place once a week, and twice a month there are jury trials, which will take at least an entire day. There is much research, and preparation for trial, and further, if we win in court the defendant still has a right to appeal. That would go to district court, which sets dates regardless of the schedule of the attorney.

Mr. Nakamura invited Council members to the court any time to watch this incredible process, and see how the attorneys handle these responsibilities. They also do a lot of screening with police officers to determine if a crime has been committed and whether it can be prosecuted.

Mr. Shaver expressed his appreciation for learning a lot of what is done, and for the caliber of staff and attorneys in the office. He asked for an explanation of the results of losing one person from the attorney's office. Mr. Critchfield responded that if one person less is



necessary, then the work load will remain what it is today, and the other employees will have to pick up the work load, the legal techs will continue preparing. Crime stays relatively constant. One sad example is the Super Bowl event on the coming Sunday. There will be a spike in domestic violence on this Sunday more than any day of the year. The Constitution imposes certain deadlines that will have to be met.

Mr. Nakamura said that the expenses for prosecution, and revenue from the court, do match up.

Ms. Francis stressed that the 5% reduction would come from personnel, and each person plays a crucial role in the process. The loss of one legal tech will put extra responsibility on all the other staff.

Mr. Nakamura thanked the Council for listening to their presentation. He stressed the importance for the Council members to know the quality of staff in the attorney's office that he has the privilege of working with. These people have shared what they do on a daily basis, and each one is an expert in their field. Mr. Critchfield is a land use attorney that any City would love to have. After 25 years in this business, to assemble attorneys and staff of this caliber is incredible, Mr. Nakamura concluded.

### **Human Resources - Mike Terry**

Mr. Terry explained the two parts to the Human Resources *Mission Statement*: To provide quality HR services to attract, develop, and retain a diverse workforce. By diverse, Mr. Terry said that there are not many companies who hire librarians and line workers, court clerks and attorneys. The diversity of Murray's personnel pool is difficult and challenging, and a certain level of expertise is necessary to interface with the various positions. Second, his office must remain in compliance with city, state, and federal labor laws.

*Core services* include recruiting, testing, selection, evaluation, and assisting the departments with disciplinary actions, as necessary. Disciplinary letters are usually drafted in his office, or the attorney's office. Benefits administration is a responsibility of the HR department: health insurance, life insurance, pension, and 401K, as well as, legal labor laws, such as the Fair Labor Standards Act, OSHA, and others. He conducts an annual Wasatch Compensation survey to ensure that we are paying staff fairly, and slotting them in the appropriate grades.

The Health and Safety manager takes care of the Workers Compensation Plan, chairs the Safety Committee, and is in charge of random drug screening. There is one pool of employees with commercial drivers' licenses that the Department of Transportation requires a different set of regulations, than the other set of employees, who are tested because they are in safety sensitive jobs, and driving City vehicles. He does on-site safety training and observations, making sure the appropriate equipment is being used, and business is conducted in a safe manner.

HR updates policy handbooks, job descriptions and evaluation programs. At the time of an employee's evaluation, each person has an opportunity to review their own job description, and update or make revisions that they and the supervisor agree upon. Accurate job

descriptions are important for recruiting personnel.

Mr. Shaver asked if the job description and compensation are compared within the city from department to department, as well as, along the Wasatch Front. Mr. Terry responded that many positions are not comparable, however, there are some general positions, such as, the secretarial positions that have citywide standards. Lead workers and supervisors are citywide, however, some individual specific positions are not comparable within the City, but they are compared to other municipalities. Mr. Terry said there are about 10 cities that Murray will compare to, however, we do have some city positions that are different from other cities. For example, we have a Deputy City Recorder who is also the city purchasing agent, and that is not seen in the marketplace, however, then the position is checked for internal equity.

Mr. Shaver asked when the last survey was done. Mr. Terry said it was in 2008. At that time the City Council decided to pay 3% above the market, therefore, any position not 3% above was given an adjustment. Mr. Shaver asked if Mr. Terry belongs to any associations or HR groups. He answered that he is part of the Wasatch HR group that meets annually, and a group of HR directors called Personnel People from Government with quarterly meetings. Mr. Shaver asked if he is hearing of other political organizations struggling. Mr. Terry said that most are, with the exception of Salt Lake County.

His office is in charge of accurately maintaining employee files, because in the event of an employee dispute, documentation and records are key.

*Inputs* indicate that the staffing of four people has remained steady that is the director, two analysts, and the safety manager. Salary hit a high in 2007-2008 and then went down after the retirement of the previous HR director. Benefits in 2008-2009 dropped when one of the analysts did not carry insurance. Operating costs decreased since 2008-2009, and then remained about the same for two years.

*Outputs* include the number of job applications, showing a peak in 2008, dropping in 2009 and then a small rebound in 2010 to a total of 724. Mr. Shaver asked when the hiring freeze began. It started in 2008, and now new hires are only to replace a position that is absolutely necessary. When this is done a salary review committee meets to discuss the position, if it must be filled, if it can be replaced at a lower grade, trying to be as creative as possible. Resignations are down because with a tight job market, most people stay where they are.

Mr. Shaver asked if he anticipates additional retirements. Mr. Terry noted that about 20% of the City employees are eligible to retire and start drawing benefits. The list includes about 80 folks, and he would anticipate about 20 might retire, depending on what sort of incentive there is.

Six job registers were created in each of the last two years. A register is created when we recruit and then leave people on a list for hiring over the next 12 months. It is a time consuming and expensive process. Full time employees citywide are 399, and part time employees work between 20 and 30 hours and receive full benefits, so the eight is a low number. Seasonal employees work part time and receive no benefits, such as at the park's department in summer, recreation center, library, and crossing guards. Turn over measure of 2.97% in 2008-2009 was extremely low by anyone's standard. Historically, we are around 6% to

10%. The 2.97% indicates people are not finding other opportunities, and retirement options are not considered very good. The past year has been on an upswing.

Some of the intangible things we do include: Answering employee questions regarding benefits or compensation, counseling employees or supervisors on employment issues, acting as a resource to help department leaders manage their people effectively, directing visitors to the correct office or building.

Mr. Terry shared some unemployment statistics from Mark Knold, Chief Economist for Utah Department of Workforce Services, showing that Utah unemployment is at 7.5% and nationwide is 9.8%. There are currently 66,000 Utahns collecting unemployment insurance, and government trends are usually 12 months behind private sector businesses. Mr. Shaver asked if this information is available by county, which it is, according to Mr. Terry. He would like it sent to him. The low point was in 2009, when 100,000 people were collecting unemployment. The interesting thing is that in Utah, young adults, 20 to 22 years old, will move in with Mom and Dad if they lose their jobs. This seems to be unique to Utah, and these people are not filing for unemployment compensation. As we come out of the recession, the City may lag behind business.

As the private sector jobs begin to open up and people choose to leave the City for other jobs, Mr. Terry will be watching closely, because when this happens a lot of institutional knowledge leaves the City. The City will need to talk about rewarding employees to prevent this from happening. He anticipates a year from now, losing a lot of very good people, without an opportunity to keep them. Mr. Shaver stated that what he has read is that those people who may be leaving would be just below mid level, not 20s, but those with some expertise looking for an upgrade or better position. Mr. Terry said that once people have been here 10 years or more, they will stay as career employees, but up until that time, they are very marketable. They have been here some time, have good knowledge, and take it somewhere else. Mr. Shaver discussed the late 50 early 60 aged people who may be looking for an incentive to leave, and then there is the group that may be hired away, so we don't have the top end, and we lose the low end. Mr. Terry would like the City to plan ahead and forecast to keep the people with knowledge. Department heads come in with a resignation from an employee, and they want to know what can be done to keep them. Ordinarily, there is nothing we can do. Once external jobs open up, people will be looking.

Mr. Terry pointed out a chart that shows all the recessions since 1948. There is a colored line for each recession indicating the beginning and the ending with the total percentage of jobs lost when the recession bottomed out. For example, in 1948 from the start of the recession it took about 12 months to bottom out at 5% of the jobs lost, then it took another 12 months to regain all those lost jobs. The red line is the current recession. It shows that the recession started 24 months before it bottomed out at 6% of jobs lost in 2009. If we follow the curve of previous recessions, and the downturn of this recession, it would indicate that we could be in full recovery by 2013. The next graph added Utah's situation, showing that we took longer to bottom out, were at 7% of jobs lost at the worst, and are more slowly coming out of the recession, according to the Department of Workforce Services.

*Issues and trends* observed show that with the lack of salary increases, some employees begin to become disgruntled, and act out. This causes an increase in employee

discipline, which results in employee legal issues. He has seen an increase in employee actions, which causes documentation and investigations. If it comes to an appeal, then there is the additional expense with outside people to hear the appeal.

The health plan is one of the largest expenses to the City, and it is being monitored continually. There is a benefit committee that is looking at ways to restructure and mitigate the amount of premium increase. As a City, our health claims are higher than most. We have an older population, with an average age of 44, which is older for a health policy.

Mr. Terry is the chair of the Benefits Committee, with Mr. Hill, Mr. Haacke, and Mr. Tarver as some of the committee members. The three main areas being looked at include drafting a retirement incentive. This is the most urgent, and the goal is to make it both cost effective, and an incentive to those who are eligible. Defining the parameters, and who would be able to participate are some of the points of research. Second, is a discussion of health plan options, with the possibility of offering a health savings account to help defray costs to the City, and help employees save for health expenses. Third, is to consider elimination of the current vacation and sick leave banks, to a unified personal time off (PTO) bank. By doing so, we can better control the number of hours accrued by employees, and have better budgeting of pay outs when people leave, because we will know what is on the books and what will be paid out more easily. Within the next six months, we hope to have some policy on these issues.

The Human Resource Department expenses are 87% employees, and 13% operating costs. If faced with implementing additional budget cuts, they would have a direct impact on Human Resource employees. This will affect the customer service we are able to offer employees.

*Possible 5% reductions* could come from the following areas. One employee would become a 30-hour employee, preserving benefits, however we would save on salary, social security deposits, and 401K amounts. That savings would come to about \$11,000. Currently, there is a \$9,000 budget to advertise job openings in the Salt Lake Tribune. He suggests we do away with that line item entirely. The cost outweighs the value we receive. Jobs are posted in numerous free locations, including the Department of Workforce Services and about 30 different agencies statewide, electronically. These items would be a total of \$20,000 in expense reductions. This job market does not necessitate the newspaper. Mr. Stam commented that many times seasonal employees become full time employees and these are good people with experience in Murray City. Reducing hours for one employee would cause minimal staffing problems.

The meeting resumed following a lunch break.

#### **Recorder's Office - Ms. Carol Heales**

The *mission* is to deliver a consistent level of service that is customer focused. The goal is to improve and sustain the level of trust and confidence our customers have in us to deliver service to their satisfaction. They intend to do that through web access to public records, business licensing, animal licensing, purchasing, and election information. Additionally, they mean to have adequate space to conduct City business in a collaborative work space. The key, Ms. Heales stated, is that web access provides a level of trust, so that people can see how business is conducted. The work space is important because use of group collaboration has been on the rise, rather than individual offices. Many times people question whether the older generation is accessing the web, and she has discovered that there is a high use of internet services by people 65 and older.

*Core services* are to provide records, issue business licenses, purchasing goods at the best value for tax dollars, and election services.

Staff members have remained the same for some time with three full time employees. A service reimbursement from other funds is realized and that revenue was \$127,836 last year.

*Outputs* show permanent records produced were 544 in 2010. The purchasing spend is difficult to identify, however, in general it has been reduced by about one million dollars that reflects budget reductions. The percent of votes cast in the election was 27.3%, or 7,403 voters, out of 27,150 registered voters.

Ms. Heales detailed the possible measures of outputs, and these were for future purposes. Some suggestions are number of records misplaced or lost, time taken to retrieve records, and destruction logs for inactive records' retention. In purchasing we could look at realized savings, aggregate purchases (for example, cost savings if different departments use the same outside providers for services). Mr. Shaver asked if that could be done for office supplies. Ms. Heales responded that it is an aggregate service and Murray utilizes the prices of the state contract. Mr. Shaver asked if an RFP could be put out. Ms. Heales explained that an RFP states that we have something to purchase and we would like to know how a company would do that for us. With a bid, we already know what we want and we seek bids for that item only without looking at any other factors.

Election costs show that we were charged \$3.43 per registered voter. With the actual voter turn out, we paid \$12.56 per voter. Increased voter participation would make the elections more cost effective.

For *effectiveness and results*, the department continues to work on the record's management program. There is an increased use of purchasing cards to control costs and administer programs such as uniform purchases. No bid protests were received. Increased use of Bidsync for posting RFP's online has resulted in an increase of participation. In elections, it seems that Murray voters have been appreciative of county efforts to provide multiple ways to vote.

Issues and trends in the Recorder's office include: a vital record's program is needed to identify and protect records containing vital information necessary for the City to continue its key functions and activities in case of an emergency/disaster. In purchasing, a purchasing card module that interfaces with accounts payables is needed to capture data and reduce processing costs, and the volume of goods and services purchased through aggregate arrangements with departments or other public entities, could produce a cost savings, as discussed earlier. Ms. Heales mentioned sustainable purchasing, which is being responsible environmentally. This would involve purchasing goods that do have a recyclable percentage or to surplus out. Another practice is to do life cycle costing on all items, including disposal, destruction, and recycling, through the life of that item.

Budget changes are very difficult in that it would mean employee cuts, or the items most important to the department. One is professional training and certifications, using local organizations, to find new ways of doing things, or discussion of issues. One example might be to discuss bid protests with an agency that has been through one, in order for Murray to understand where the process might have broken down to avoid such occurrence here.

On the state archives website you can see where Murray has microfilmed permanent records, which can be accessed there. They do charge the City for that, therefore, we plan to defer additional microfilming. Mr. Shaver talked about ways to reduce use of city materials, such as paper and pencils. Ms. Heales pointed out that by having more electronic processes

will cut down on paper usage.

### **Business Licenses**

*Core services* in business licensing is to issue and renew business licenses to commercial and home-based businesses, to collaborate with the Finance department to produce sales tax reports, and to support Animal Control by issuing and renewing animal licenses.

Employees are one full time, and one part time (20 hours) with some benefits. The revenue on business licensing shows that the costs are more than covered.

*Outputs* show that Murray issues just under 600 licenses. Over the past year, Ms. Willden recovered \$143,000 in sales tax. It is usually due to mis coding on individual businesses, unregistered for reporting sales tax, or at the state level. Animal licenses have not been tracked to date, but could be for future statistics.

Ms. Heales identified some outputs that could be possible future measures, such as the number of licenses not approved within 14 days, and commercial businesses not licensed. She said that there is the possibility to collaborate with GIS to merge licensing information with commercial parcels to create a list of potential businesses operating without a license. Administrative costs for animal licensing have not been tracked in the recorder's office.

Ms. Heales mentioned that she has had increased support from Community & Economic Development to resolve licensing issues on unapproved businesses, and code enforcement has been effective in resolving unlicensed businesses.

*Trends and issues* consist of manual operations that could be improved upon by having electronic processes. One example is the option to renew a business license on line, however, the first application must be done in the office. Licensing of rental units will be a large project going forward. Sometimes it is hard to identify rental units in private homes. It would probably take intensive work the first year, although, maintenance would not be too time consuming. Ms. Heales noted that a fee study might be beneficial. There will be a cost of about \$25,000 to that study, however, it has not been done for five years. She feels it would be worthwhile especially in hasmat fees and the rental units. We could do an informal study, but it lends credibility by having a professional do it.

Possible budget reductions would have to come from employee expense. The only other area to cut would be the professional training, which consists of a conference once a year to keep up to date on legislation changes, sales tax issues, but is not mandated.

### **Government Building**

*Core services* are to conduct planned, preventive maintenance, on building systems, daily, weekly, monthly, and quarterly to provide a clean workplace; respond to service repair requests; provide seasonal landscape maintenance and snow removal; and to conduct citywide remodels.

Reducing this *budget* is very challenging, as there is only one staff person. The cost to maintain is based on cost per square foot. There are approximately 44,200 square feet, and the cost decreased some last year, to \$7.28 per square foot. That cost might increase this year, as the condenser in one of the cooling units need's replacement, and a problem of leaks in some

of the propane tanks have been discovered. Those have been out there for a long time, and repair involves removing them from the site.

Ms. Heales showed a slide detailing the age of the building and its components. High dollar repairs have been deferred. Mr. Shaver asked what buildings this department refers to. Ms. Heales stated that it is only the City Center building that her department handles.

In *issues and trends*, Ms. Heales pointed out that the lack of a capital replacement program demand that emergency repairs be paid for out of each current operating budget. An energy efficient project could be a possibility, however, not knowing how long the City will utilize this building, it is difficult to measure how cost effective one might be. The work spaces in this building are not set up for a networked world, and more space for collaborative work is desirable. Some government buildings are being retrofitted for a more sustainable operation. She does have someone coming in to talk about that possibility, and there are about nine different businesses on the state contract that do offer services to retrofit.

Budget expenditures have remained very constant. Cuts would have to come from salary. She is still deferring carpet and window repair.

Mr. Shaver remarked that it would help Ms. Heales if the City knew what was going to be done with the City Center building.

Mr. Brass expressed his pleasure at seeing someone address sustainable issues. He has found that a lot can be done with motion sensed light switches. He learned that dimmer switches are set at 90%, so even if the dimmer function is never used, there is a savings of energy. The fluorescent tubes will not be able to be purchased after next year. It will be necessary to refixture the building. The impact of this will be huge.

### **Public Service - Doug Hill**

Mr. Hill stated that because they have all had a number of discussions and are very transparent with each other he would go quickly through the presentation, answering questions when asked. When all the departments were put together, he had outside help in developing the following vision statement.

The *mission* of the Public Services Department is to help Murray City be the best City through valuing citizens, customers, and all City employees by:

- Being Creative
- Increasing knowledge
- Sharing resources
- Providing meaningful services
- Including citizens in decision making
- Communicating with elected officials
- Ensuring safe infrastructures

### **Building Inspection**

*Core services* are to conduct building plan reviews, complying with various building codes: the International Building Code, mechanical, plumbing, electrical, and energy codes. Two individuals do plan review making sure all the plans are in compliance with the various codes. Once a permit is issued, site inspection and coordination of permits will take place. Murray was one of the first cities to have a one-stop shop, where the property owner submits his plans, and then we make sure that all the necessary departments, water, fire, sewer, and power sign off on the plans. Code enforcement and inspections are done following that. When the economy slowed down, the follow-up inspections have taken place. That is how Mr. Hill kept his inspectors busy. There were as many as 1,800, and now less than 100 inspections remain outstanding. He does work with the business license office to inspect new businesses making sure they comply with building codes. Inspections of the Smelter Site are done to ensure compliance on environmental issues. There is one inspector that knows everything about the environmental requirements, laws, drainage, and he handles these inspections, as well as Fireclay. Appeals can be taken to the Board of Appeals, however, there has been no appeal for three years. Mr. Brass asked if people know they can appeal a decision. Mr. Hill said that it is not something they advertise, however, today there are not many complaints.

*Inputs* show that the employees were increased about three years ago. During the construction of the hospital, there was a backlog in plan review, therefore we went from eight staff members to nine, two of those do plan review. Recently, one inspector retired, who will not be replaced. Currently, there are eight inspectors. If necessary, he has considered going down another employee to seven. The only downside is that it would be a plan review person, and when the market turns around we will be faced with the same scenario again, although we do not anticipate that soon. Mr. Brass reminded the group that Miller Development is very active. Mr. Hill said he realized that, and doesn't want to get behind.

This budget is indicative of other departments showing increases from fiscal years 2006-2007, 2007-2008, and 2008-2009 being the peak, and then 2009-2010, 2010-2011 coming down, and then down more in the 2011-2012 year. Some years' revenue had more than covered the costs of inspection, some more than one million dollars, although, last year the City subsidized inspections by about \$211,000.

*Outputs* confirm what we have discussed with the peak in 2007, and then decreasing numbers, however, the follow-up inspections have been ongoing. It really is just a reflection of the economy and construction. There are still a number of projects being worked on at Fashion Place Mall, Larry Miller, Hamlett, Fireclay Villages, and a few offices and bank buildings.

*Issues and trends* show a move toward electronic plan software review. It is an on-line system that prevents the owner from bringing in the large roll out plans, which are then marked up by the City, and taken to the job site for adjustments. We do track electronically, but the plans are hand marked. The new software allows everything to be done electronically, and the owner prints the final copy to take to the job site. The cost to that is fairly substantial, because the computers and monitors have to be converted to that system. Mr. Stam said that he has seen people bring in one set, mark it up, and then it is scanned into the computer. Mr. Hill stated that the City does not have the large scale scanner. This has only been done by Salt Lake City for a couple of years, so we are not way behind the trend.

The second trend seen is adopting a new energy code. Utah State Legislature has resisted adopting the international energy code due to the increased construction costs to a home. The Realtors and Builders Association are fairly strong in lobbying efforts against that. It will probably happen in time.

Internal fund transfers occur between the power department and general fund for



electrical reviews done, amounting to about \$75,000 per year. Capital purchases included a retaining wall that the City rebuilt and then had to actually sue the owner for the expense. It never works out for the City.

A 5% budget reduction would be seen by the retiring building inspector who would not be replaced.

### **Cemetery**

*Core services* are to sell lots, take care of property maintenance, interments, snow removal around the cemetery, schedule with private funeral homes, maintain records (online), and help people on site.

Inputs remain steady at four full time employees, one part time office staff, and three seasonal to help with mowing in the summer time. The cost to run the cemetery in 2010 was \$113,000, because there is revenue from lot sales and burials. There is no reason for the number of burials to go up or down. Mr. Page, at the cemetery, does not think the non resident fee increase has had any bearing on the number of burials.

There are 156 burial sites left, and at the current rate of sale, we will be totally sold out in two years. Mr. Page has asked for funds to remove a road, which would provide another 120 lots generating about \$90,000 in revenue over time. The cost to remove a road would be about \$25,000.

The perpetual care fund was set up when the property to the east of the cemetery was sold, and it was established with \$500,000. It has been 27 years since then, and the fund is at \$1.3 million, however, at the current interest rate, we only earned \$8,000 on that money last year. At this rate, with no more sales, burials, or revenue, the perpetual care fund would cover the cemetery operations for three years. The original idea was great, however, the City cannot expect that this fund will take care of the operation of the cemetery. The City does put money into the perpetual care fund, and transfers out to the general fund are made. Mr. Hill said that in looking for short term money to balance the budget, there is nothing to prevent the City from transferring more money into the general fund from the perpetual care fund. Obviously, in the long term there will be less money to cover cemetery expense. This is an idea, not necessarily a good idea. Mr. Johns clarified that the code allows transfers out up to the difference between revenues and cemetery budgeted expense. Without a change in the ordinance, for 2010, the transfer could have been the \$113,000 that the City subsidized the cemetery.

An overtime fee is charged for evening, weekend, and holiday burials. Additionally, we discovered that there was a water line with no meter. Now a meter has been installed and water charges will be incurred. This budget will need to be increased in the coming year. Elimination of the seasonal employees is about the only way to reduce this budget. He does not recommend that.

### **Cultural Arts and History**

A lengthy list of *core services* is headed up by Mary Ann Kirk, who does not work full time. She is considered full time, at more than 30 hours per week. She has a passion for history, and most places do not group the arts and history together, however, she has built up history, with the museum, historic preservation, and education. She works with two boards. The staffing has remained steady with seven seasonal employees, six who work at the amphitheater

in the summer, and one at the museum.

We do get a number of grants, and the other revenue comes from ticket sales. The City subsidizes the program at about \$212,000 per year. Arts in the Park are under this area. Mr. Shaver pointed out that much of what we do does not generate income, therefore, even with ticket sales, it is misleading. Mr. Hill commented that the policy of the City has been to try to cover the direct costs of the program, for example, the fees charged will offset the cost of the production, and seasonal employees, but it does not cover the cost of the full time staff and overhead on facilities.

*Outputs* show all the things done over the year and lately time was spent on completion of an operational plan and schematic design for the performing arts center, which will allow us to move forward on funding mechanisms and the county application. A mural was completed by Murray students under the Jordan River parkway. Attendance at the amphitheater was nearly 12,000 people for the season, and you can read some information about the museum tours.

*Issues and trends* center on the performing arts space and the need for a reliable and affordable location for increased participation in the arts. In history, how to address the aging neighborhoods and homes is a concern of historic preservation. If there is going to be a new City hall, location of the museum is a question. Taking advantage of social media is a common discussion with recreation and arts, advertising our facilities and programs in the most cost effective manner. Protection of historic landmarks has been an issue for a few years.

The City does give grants to various community organizations that are art related, and the Murray schools for their art programs. This was put together to prevent each individual group from approaching the Mayor or City Council for funding and donations.

For 5% budget reductions, Ms. Kirk proposes to reduce advertising and grants, and apply for fewer grants, thereby, limiting the matching portion from our budget. Some maintenance costs at the amphitheater can be reduced, and charging additional fees for some things can be instituted.

Mr. Hill gave a quick update on the performing arts center application to the county. The county has indicated that the deadline is February 28 for a prioritized list of funding. There are no funds at this time. The City would like to submit an application, and there is a resolution for support scheduled to be acted upon at the City Council meeting on February 15. The preliminary cost estimate is for a \$17 million facility, with about \$2 million in soft costs, without the parking. A parking garage of about \$15 million would have to be constructed simultaneously, with a portion of parking garage costs to be included with the county request. We would ask them for 50% of those construction costs. An entity can ask for up to 50%, however, we do not know what the county wants to do. If we could get \$12.5 million from the county, then we would have to decide how to come up with the City portion. There is no request from the Council at this time, however, he indicated that the county would expect the City to do its part.

## **Engineering**

The *focus* of engineering is on transportation: traffic, pavement, and storm water management, fix curb, gutter, sidewalk and ADA ramps. Construction management inside public right-of-way is our responsibility, making sure reconstruction is done properly, when utility work is done. It does negatively impact our roadways, and we inspect their work. Much of it is in the evening or after hours which requires extra time and adjusting schedules. We coordinate

with UTA and UDOT, and do GIS work specifically for our department, collecting data specifically for our purposes. Issue permits, apply for grants, plan review, and land disturbance permits.

The number of employees in engineering was increased in FY 2007-2008. This was done without adding an employee to the City, by replacing a lost water department employee with an engineer. This probably resulted in a slight increase to payroll costs. The seasonal employee will not be replaced in next year's budget. In the past there has been an intern working with the City to assist in updating the pavement management plan. There is a little revenue, however, most of it gets coded into other departments, such as streets, and power.

The *outputs* are construction related and you will note that new GIS software was installed. The work in engineering stays relatively constant with utilities and work in right-of-ways. Mr. Hill pointed out a long list of projects the department worked on through the year. Mr. Shaver asked what SWPPP stood for. Mr. Hill stated that it is storm water pollution prevention plan. It is something the City requires of everybody else, however, now it is required that the City come into compliance.

*Trends* include updating the storm water plan, and fighting with other entities for federal and state dollars. We always try to get projects on the list, because they plan five years out. Now they are taking requests for 2016. If you don't get on the list, you are not even eligible for matching funding. In many ways, we are committing these dollars, even though we do not know what that budget will even look like. Currently, we are trying to get the rest of 5900 South east bound on the list, Mr. Hill noted. On the statewide transportation improvement plan (STIP) now, there is the Main Street bridge, that is a 20% match to 80% funding. The matching funds are quite generous, some as great as 93% from the state. On the list for 2014 is 5900 South, west of State Street. Worth noting is that GIS does a lot of things for people in other departments, and give advice to anyone needing help with engineering projects.

Reducing 5% in the *budget* would be to eliminate the intern for pavement updates, limit training, moving the funding of one GIS employee to one of the enterprise funds, and limiting computer upgrades.

### **Fleet Services**

Fleet takes care of about 450 vehicles and pieces of equipment owned by the City. They provide preventive maintenance, and help with vehicle purchasing, and licensing. They take care of fuel, with both our own fuel tanks and contract fuel tanks at gas stations, using state pricing.

Employees have been reduced in fleet. The revenue brought in through inter departmental service charges has not offset the cost of fleet. As a City, we have decided that it is better to have our own fleet, rather than contract that out to a private company. The reduction in employees is an effort to reduce the cost charged out to other budgets. Any revenue brought into fleet, comes from other departments in the City.

Fleet measures their work by the number of job orders, which have been increasing. This is a reflection that the City is using vehicles longer. Productivity is a percentage of the number of hours billed out to job orders.

The current *trend* is to no longer fund fleet maintenance the way Murray City does it. A long term replacement plan is being set up so that when a vehicle needs replacement the

money is available, rather than relying on replacement. It is more costly to keep a vehicle longer than seven years. Most cities and agencies now have a replacement program set up. Implementing that program costs money.

Finance worked with fleet to determine fixed costs to be charged to each department. These funds are then transferred to the Central Garage Fund to cover their costs. The auditors recommended this be set up, and really all we are doing is taking money from the various departments for this fund.

*Budget* reductions of \$17,000 would consist of delaying some preventive maintenance in the shop itself, by using cleaning solutions longer, and delay purchases of shop equipment. Mr. Shaver asked if that was acceptable. Mr. Hill said that Mr. Hammer is comfortable with that plan without sacrificing quality.

### **Heritage Center**

Mr. Hill commented that the Heritage Center is a facility of almost 16,000 square feet, and has just celebrated its 30<sup>th</sup> anniversary. The building is aging. The Center offers programs for seniors aged 55 and older, with the lunch meal. Transportation and trips are very popular, using an older van. They adopted a policy to only rent the facility to senior groups. There is not much revenue for after hour rentals. Volunteer work is a big part of the center, and a 501(c)(3) is an arm of the center to be able to receive grants and take donations.

They are down one employee, a victim of the soft hiring freeze. What has been done is to split the hours with a recreation employee who is half time at the center and half time in recreation. There are a number of seasonal people who work in the kitchen, front desk, and teach classes.

Mr. Hill mentioned his pet peeve is that the Heritage Center is one of the few senior centers not operated as part of the county system. It is a fairly expensive endeavor, costing the City more than \$460,000 per year. He often wonders if Murray should approach the county for funding of our center too. The down side is that we could give up much of the control that we currently have. Mr. Stam added that more than just Murray residents participate. Mr. Hill confirmed that about 55% of participants live outside Murray City. It is common, as the swimming pool, and recreation center are heavily subsidized too. That is just the way Murray is.

Meals show a slight decrease, particularly on Mondays, so one budget reduction measure would be to discontinue meals on Mondays. Duplicated attendance has increased slightly over the years. You can read through the numerous activities on your own.

*Trends* are to continue working toward changing the front entrance, to get the lobby closer to the drop off area to improve safety concerns, and upgrade the appearance. Some money was allocated through CDBG last year, the center has raised \$33,000, and they are hopeful for more CDBG funding this year. Mr. Shaver asked if there were an actual bid for the project. Mr. Hill stated that they do not have a bid. Any extra money would be used for carpeting and furnishings. The center is really trying to reach out to the younger senior population, age 55 to 65. The 501(c)(3) has its own Board of Trustees to control the money, which has been used to purchase equipment, make upgrades to the building, pay for scholarships for seniors who can't afford the fees and in general assist the Heritage Center in their mission to provide programs and services for the general health and well being of older adults.

For *budget reductions*, they could eliminate the transportation service that picks up

about three people each week, reducing the cost of the bus driver. Ceramic classes, meals, training opportunities, and vehicle maintenance could be reduced. Other reductions would come from deferring the purchase of computers and equipment.

### **Golf Course**

The golf course is an enterprise fund and the *core services* are to maintain the course, driving range, pro shop, café, carts, and work with the public on tournaments and league schedules.

Mr. Hill stated that funding has been fairly constant through the years. He mentioned that in comparing the Murray course with others in the valley, we probably have more full time employees and fewer seasonal employees. The café is unusual with two part time staff members. Most golf courses do not run the café, but it is contracted out. That is something we can look at. The golf course revenues are not great this year, they are lower than any other year since it opened. Budgets do need to be cut, and he acknowledged that we are staffed differently, and we could save some money, however, it would involve laying some people off because he doesn't feel that any would take advantage of an early retirement. Mr. Brass asked if revenue is off due to the weather. Mr. Hill confirmed weather the last two spring seasons has been horrible, so that is part of it. Even in the good months, rounds of golf are down.

Murray golf is probably one of a couple that usually have a profit, Mr. Hill explained. The county puts \$2 million per year into gold courses. Because this is an enterprise fund, money is contributed to the general fund. Over the last four calendar years rounds of golf have decreased by about 20,000. The national golf foundation says that the number of golfers will catch up with the number of courses in the next five years.

The golf course has a number of capital project needs, some of which are critical. For instance, the irrigation system needs to be replaced at an estimated cost of more than \$2 million. Because the golf course revenues for years funded General Fund projects such as the Jordan River Parkway, reserves are at a minimum and insufficient for such costly projects. A decision needs to be reached on how to resolve this dilemma. He has suggested that the general fund may need to help with the irrigation funding at the golf course. The building is older, and we hear from golfers that the driving range needs to be lengthened. That is one project that has been discussed. The water quality is a problem, and there are ways to solve it, but they all cost money, Mr. Hill noted.

Mr. Stam asked about discounting golf rounds. Discounting has become the norm with golf courses, Mr. Hill commented. Murray has tried to resist it, and maybe that is one reason rounds are down, because people can get discounts other places. We are looking at discounting in slow periods, which are generally, late morning to early afternoon. One idea is a bounce back discount within the next week.

Mr. Hill said that capital costs on the *Input* page are not included because they have been 'capitalized' and amounts were not readily available but can be obtained if interested. Typically, capital funds are used to purchase maintenance equipment or to make improvements to facilities. Because the golf course is an enterprise fund, money for improvements varies from year to year depending on projected revenues and fund balance.

### **Park Center**

*Core services* are to take care of everything that goes on inside the 65,000 square foot building: membership sales; customer service; programming for recreation, fitness and aquatic classes; coordinating with Murray Schools (it is partially their facility); maintaining equipment; marketing; building security, and ASCAP fees compliance.

Mr. Shaver commented that marketing is in many of the departments, such as, arts, Heritage Center, recreation, etc. He wondered if we could have one person or company outside the city market for all these areas, with the focus to be driving income up. Staff people are doing the marketing, who are not experts in this field. Mr. Hill said that he would support that, and some agencies and cities have marketing people. He goes to conferences, and the marketing classes feature experts who do nothing but market city programs. Salt Lake County Parks and Recreation, and Cottonwood Heights both have a marketing person.

Mr. Stam asked about coordinating with the school district. He wondered if the school district could compensate the Park Center for the time of lost revenue when it uses the center. Mr. Hill said that the City went through this five years ago and it was an unpleasant meeting. The Mayor said that the schools insist that they give up more than the City in exchange for usage. The school put in \$2 million for the construction of the center. The taxpayers pay for it whether it is the City or the school.

*Inputs* show that there is a steady full time staff of four individuals. There are 139 people on the seasonal records, however, some of them work occasionally, and some are really not working now. It does include fitness instructors, referees, and life guards. We will be removing some of these folks who we do not expect to work for Murray again. It is an inflated number. Mr. Hill expressed that the Park Center has fewer full time employees than most recreation centers in the county. We do rely more on seasonal help. By the time the debt service costs are included the net cost to the City is about \$1.4 million. There are eleven years remaining on the bond. The good news is that through December 31 there was a huge increase in the number of memberships sold. We did publicize the fee increase and allowed people to purchase two years in advance at the existing rates.

Mr. Shaver said that he wants to meet with Ms. Williams at the end of the year to see what can be done next to help the revenue. Increasing membership fees was the first step. Since the Park Center opened in 2002, there has been a steady increase in participation, Mr. Hill stated.

*Issues and trends* indicate that people are interested in improved health through activity and exercise bringing more people into the Center. One conflict is that the more crowded it becomes the more conflicts we have. Fitness was not intended to be the primary focus of the facility, therefore, people cannot get a treadmill or elliptical anytime they want it. Limited areas and equipment exist for these activities. Another problem is that the more we schedule the gym and pool with Junior Jazz or swim meets, the more members complain about the lack of access. Mr. Hill stated that he is working with the school district to limit that. The Park Center pool is the best pool available for swim meets.

Aging fitness equipment needs to be replaced more regularly, although, some was purchased this year.

We are getting a good retention rate on memberships, especially with corporate members. There are 2,722 Murray residents, and 632 nonresidents with memberships.

The debt service will be paid off in 2022.

*Budget reductions* of 5% will probably result in early closures on Fridays, and Sunday closures. We will eliminate some advertising, training, and delay purchases.

## **Parks**

*Core services* include management and maintenance of all park and open space areas including: ball fields, playgrounds, pavilions, waterways, trails, traffic islands, flowers, and several public right-of-ways. The park's department: maintains swimming pools because they are better prepared to do so, coordinates with the recreation division and outside organizations for scheduling, and prepare parks and ball fields. Garbage pick up is done by parks, and removal of graffiti. They work with volunteers and scout troops on projects. There is an advisory board. The staff takes care of some snow removal.

*Inputs* have remained the same, with 12 full time, and one 30-hour part time employee. One part time left and this person was not replaced, as it did occur during the hiring freeze. There is not much revenue in parks, except for pavilion rental, which is constant. It is good to see that the graffiti removal has decreased.

*Outputs* show all the projects that have been completed in parks, and Mr. Sorensen works with volunteers as much as paid staff. The numbers show more than 1,700 hours of volunteer help by residents in 2010.

The biggest *issue* in parks is the aging infrastructure. Playgrounds are old, and Southwood Park is 18 years old. The pavilions need replacement. One structure is rotting terribly, and Mr. Hill will meet with Mr. Sorensen the following day to determine what should be done. Mr. Sorensen is concerned about keeping it open this summer. It is pavilion two, near Parkside Elementary School. Vehicles are 16 years old, which is a concern, as well. Sixteen years ago there was a fire at the park that burned nine vehicles at once. They were all purchased at that time and now there are no funds for replacement. The lack of funding to invest in deteriorating facilities is a huge concern.

*Budget reductions* of 5% would mean fewer seasonal employees, eliminating travel, education, training, buying less fertilizer, cutting down on watering, and stocking fewer fish in Willow Pond.

## **Recreation**

The department manages 35 youth, and 30 adult programs, as well as, seven special events. Two special events were eliminated this year, the Easter Egg Hunt and Haunted Trail, which was picked up by the Exchange Club. The Easter Egg Hunt may be taken over by the American Legion. Recreation takes care of software and on-line programs, and registration. They coordinate and schedule facilities with the park's maintenance staff. There is a lot of staff to supervise, and equipment to purchase. Volunteer recruitment, finding coaches for all the teams, is a large part of the recreation department. Scheduling and payment of officials is completed here. Staff does marketing, and works with the advisory board.

*Inputs* show one full time employee now part time with the Heritage Center. Revenue through fees and charges is about \$255,000 per year, and the City subsidy is about \$500,000 per year.

Participation looks to be increasing somewhat, however, over a longer period of time, the trend is down because the City population is aging, and there are not as many kids in activities. Programming is constantly tweaked and now two most popular programs are adult dodge ball and kick ball. Volleyball has a strong program.

*Trends* show an interest in extreme recreation programming. Competitive sports leagues are more important as people specialize, thus affecting participation in recreational sports. Mr. Stam added that the parents are getting the kids involved in these things. The perpetual problem is not having enough facilities at the peak times of the year. This budget makes a donation of \$125,000 to the Boys and Girls Club.

Decreases of 5% in this budget would eliminate Murray Journal advertising, and Mr. Hill expressed his concern about that. It does help the Murray Journal, and without some information going to the homes, he does not know how people would find out what is going on. Mr. Plant feels that he could utilize electronic advertising, email, and the schools. Mr. Shaver said that it takes awhile to build that list of emails, although, that has been asked for in the past. Sporting equipment purchases, and postage can be reduced, as well. Mr. Shaver asked about corporate sponsors for some of the recreational activities. That has been discussed, possibly approaching Intermountain Medical Center, who pays no property taxes, and asking for funding for some recreation programs. Mr. Hill stated that the last city he worked for, every youth team had a sponsor. It takes a lot of effort to find that many sponsors. Mr. Shaver said that it becomes very difficult to do that. He said that another option was to reduce Boys and Girls Club by the same percentage that has been requested of the department. Mr. Hill said that he has mentioned that to Bob Dunn, Director.

### **Roadways**

Mulch, in roadways was questioned by Mr. Shaver. The Mayor said this is because a lot of work is done in-house, rather than contracting it out.

Mr. Stam asked if 4800 South would be reconstructed this year, with the money from the legislature. Mr. Hill said yes, it was being designed now. If a project is over a certain amount of money, it is required by state law for the job to be contracted out. Mr. Hill said it is too big a job for Murray staff, our pavers and other equipment are not large enough.

An early retirement incentive is something that would affect a number of people in the streets' department.

Ms. Dunn asked how long it will be before a retirement recommendation or incentive will be given to the Council. Mr. Hill responded that the benefits' committee has put together a draft policy that is being reviewed by the attorney's office and department heads. Ms. Wells said department heads will give their recommendations to the Mayor, however, the challenging thing is to know who would be replaced and who would not. Then numbers will be run by Ms. Wilson and Mr. Johns. Ms. Wells said in two to three weeks it would probably be available to the Council. Mr. Hill said that by the first part of April the employees would be made aware, so that during budget time, the Council will know how many people might be affected.

### **Road Construction**

Mr. Hill explained that in road construction only money brought in from the gas tax will be used for improvements, unless other funds become available.

### **Shop and Garage**



This account is for maintenance on the public services buildings and property at 500 West. The big issue is that storm water improvements must be done on these properties owned by the City. There are no employees. A roof problem exists there.

### **Solid Waste**

Mr. Hill announced that Ace Disposal has asked the City to implement a contaminated recycling program. They have done this with other cities. For the recycling can, they have hired someone to inspect the cans on a regular basis. If they find contaminated materials in those cans, they would like to leave a notice with the property owner. We get about a 12% to 16% contamination rate in Murray, which is a little higher than most of the county. The contamination does not refer to oil or toxic waste, it is Styrofoam, glass, clothing, and items that are not recyclable. This hurts Ace, because when it is sorted, Ace is charged for those non recyclable items reducing their profitability. Ace would like Murray to implement what is called the "three strikes and you're out" program. If something is seen, an education notice will be put on the can stating it is a first strike, and if it happens three times, then the City picks up the can, and they would be charged a fee to get it back. Mr. Hill said it has not been discussed much, but he wanted the Council to be aware.

Ms. Dunn said that she agrees with the concept, however, the approach may make people just begin to put everything in garbage. Mr. Hill realizes that the Council and Mayor will get the phone calls when people get angry. The Mayor said that after three warnings, people are not paying attention.

Mr. Shaver said that there are two issues, we are trying to encourage people to be proactive in being environmentally, conscience, however, there is the economic factor for the collection company.

Mr. Stam asked if a notice could go out to the residents before this takes affect, because he feels many people are not educated about recycling. Mr. Hill thanked the Council for their feedback.

### **Storm Water**

This is one area where there is some growth, due to the number of regulations. Council members confirmed that they are not getting the number of complaints about storm water that they did previously. The Mayor stated that he defends the policy to people when necessary.

### **Outdoor Swimming Pool**

Mr. Hill stated that the number of employees has remained steady over the years, however, the seasonal number is a little inflated due to the issue discussed earlier. After hours rentals are a popular thing now.

Ms. Dunn asked if after hours rentals are done at the Park Center too. Mr. Hill confirmed that, but stated that not many people are willing to pay the fee.

### **Water Department**

Water and waste water have been discussed numerous times over the past few months, therefore, Mr. Hill concluded his presentation.

Ms. Wells asked the Council's thoughts regarding a mid year budget discussion. Ms. Wilson will be happy to provide any information the Council desires, and then if more meetings are wanted, they can be scheduled.

Ms. Dunn commented that none of the Year End reports have addressed the current year. She would like to know how things are going relative to all the cuts made the previous year.

Ms. Wells said that in the past the administration has provided information detailing how much was spent when 50% of the year has elapsed. She asked if they wanted more than that. Ms. Dunn would like to know how last year's cut have affected the departments. Mr. Shaver added that any line item far exceeding the 50% mark, should be referenced with an explanation. Ms. Wells said that a narrative could be provided on those items. Ms. Dunn reiterated her desire to know about the results of the cuts. Additionally, she would like departments to look at programs. She would like to know if there are programs that they consider extremely beneficial that are underfunded, and conversely, are some programs still funded that are not as necessary to the City. This will help the Council going forward, in that, they will be less likely to cut program dollars that are extremely beneficial.

Mr. Shaver gave two examples heard during the Year End meetings: closing the Park Center on Sunday, and cutting the Heritage Center meals on Mondays. If services are not being used, is it cost effective to continue, or would a reduction in this area be helpful, Mr. Shaver proposed.

Ms. Wells stated her hope that the current reports would bring out these issues, where the dollars are spent on programs, and if that is where we want to spend it. Mr. Shaver and Ms. Dunn both confirmed how helpful these meetings have been, hearing from the department heads related to the importance of what they do. It is good to have the discussions together, and prior to decisions during the budget process. He expressed his appreciation for what the administration put together here. Now he is able to see things from another perspective.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:33 p.m.

Janet M. Lopez  
Council Office Administrator