

Minutes of the Design Review Committee meeting held on September 27, 2012, at 5:30 p.m. in the Murray Public Services Building Conference Room, 4646 South 500 West, Murray, Utah.

Present: Design Review Committee:
Jay Bollwinkel – Vice Chair
Ned Hacker
Darrell Jones
Chad Wilkinson, Community Development Manager
Tim Tingey, Admin & Development Services Director

Excused: Jim Allred, Chair

Jay Bollwinkel opened the meeting.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Mr. Jones to approve the minutes for June 26, 2012.

Mr. Hacker seconded the motion.

A voice vote was made. Motion passed 3-0.

II. BOARD REPORTS

No report was given.

III. BUSINESS

STATE AND VINE HOTEL– 4909, 4913 & 4915 South State Street – Project # 12-117

Ryan Mackowiak is the applicant requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new 123 room hotel and retail space within the Murray City Center District (MCCD) zoning district. Chad Wilkinson reviewed the request and location at the property addressed 4913 South State Street. The hotel would replace an existing strip mall and former convenience store. The development will consist of a four story building with retail space located on the ground floor and hotel rooms above. The net retail space will be approximately 9,200 square feet. The project is subject to review and approval by the Planning Commission, and additional conditions addressing traffic, utilities, and other issues related to the overall site design will be addressed through a separate report. A summary of the building and site design elements is included below. The proposed building will front on both State and Vine Streets as required by the MCCD ordinance. The building will be approximately 60 feet in height with some architectural features extending to 66 feet. The MCCD ordinance has no height restrictions for buildings located more than 150 feet from residentially zoned properties. The building is located approximately 260 feet from the nearest residentially zone properties to the east. The exterior façade will be a combination of EIFS material and cementitious siding along with fenestration. Main colors include dark brown and light beige. Trim will consist of aluminum banding in both silver and green. The MCCD Design Guidelines call for the use of muted colors and earth tones for primary building colors and the use of compatible vibrant colors as accents. The proposed color scheme is consistent with the

guidelines. The retail areas will consist of aluminum-framed windowed store fronts surrounded by a dark brown stone tile. The stone tile meets the standards of the MCCD which requires that the building meet the ground with a base architectural element to connect the building to the landscape. The building has entries on both streets as required for corner lots in the MCCD. Most entries appear to be covered by the cantilevered portion of the upper floors or appear to be recessed. Any entries that are not located under the upper floors or that are not recessed will need to be covered by a canopy or awning as required by ordinance. Landscaping is proposed along both frontages between the building and sidewalk. In addition the Vine Street frontage will be widened to include the required 12 foot pedestrian sidewalk including the 8 foot pedestrian zone and 4 foot furnishing or landscape strip. Dedication will be required for sidewalk areas as part of the Planning Commission review of the project. Interior landscaping is provided within the parking area at the rear of the building. The design guidelines encourage the use of landscaping in the parking area, both to break up large paved areas and to provide opportunities for integrated storm water and runoff pretreatment. The MCCD standards include requirements to pretreat storm water runoff and the applicant is encouraged to integrate storm water treatment within the landscape areas. Parking is located to the side and rear of the building as required by the MCCD standards. The development will require some reconfigurations of driveways along State Street including abandoning the southern driveway and widening the northern driveway. Both of these revisions will require approval from the Utah Department of Transportation which will be included as a condition of approval of planning commission. The development also includes the widening of Court Avenue, a public right of way that runs to the north of the site. The lighting standards of the code require that lighting be shielded and additional detail on lighting for the site will be required prior to permit for the site.

Based on analysis of the design review guidelines staff recommends that the overall design is consistent with the design guidelines and recommends that the Design Review Committee recommend approval of the proposed hotel and retail development to the Planning Commission with the following conditions:

1. Exterior lighting and parking lot lighting should be shielded and should not spill onto adjacent properties and shall comply with the design guidelines.
2. All entrances shall be covered or recessed in accordance with section 17.170.110.
3. The applicant shall provide details on the screening of trash receptacles and any exterior mechanical equipment. Screening shall be of compatible materials with the main structure.
4. Provide street furnishings in compliance with the design guidelines.

Mr. Hacker asked if there are any residences on the east side. Mr. Wilkinson stated there is either a duplex or triplex to the east of this property on Vine Street. There are also some businesses on the corner of Vine Street and Center Street.

Mr. Hacker asked what the banding looks like on the exterior. Ryan Mackowiak stated the green is a branded look and the horizontal silver banding is tucked in underneath the siding. It was noted that it truly represents their architectural rendering. Mr. Wilkinson made mention that originally there was a slightly different color scheme, but in working within the design guidelines they have muted the colors a bit more, adding some vibrant accent colors.

Ron Witzel, 2180 South 1300 East stated that this hotel will be a Hilton Extended Stay. The hotel is in negotiations with the tenants that are currently in there on leasing.

The question was asked if there would also be the potential to have retailers as tenants on site or outdoor restaurant seating. Mr. Witzel stated that having several different tenants is a great way to pull pedestrians in. Mr. Mackowiak noted that in the back of the hotel there will be areas where the hotel guests can sit and eat. Mr. Wilkinson noted this particular building is outside the height limitation of 150 feet, so there is no limitation on height and their plans meet the minimum height. The applicant has proposed a 60 foot tall building with some architectural features that go a bit beyond that.

Mr. Hacker made a motion to forward a recommendation of approval to the Planning Commission for the proposed hotel and retail development, at the property addressed 4915 South State Street based on the conditions 1-4 as listed by staff.

Mr. Jones seconded the motion.

A voice vote was made. Motion passed 3-0.

KIDZ ACADEMY – 4790 South Hanauer Street – Project # 12-121

Isabelle Lopez the applicant requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for a preschool business to be located within an 11,977 sq. ft. existing building. Ray Christensen reviewed the application and location at the property addressed 4790 South Hanauer Street. This property is on a corner lot and was previously used as an auto repair business. There is a future plan for Hanauer Street to become a one way street as part of the Cottonwood Street extension. There may be future changes needed to this property as a result of the Cottonwood Street extension. The parking lot is in front of the building and the building is non-conforming to the current MCCD code regarding the building setback on the south frontage of the property. The information provided with the plans indicates the age distribution from infant to five years with a total of 89 children. Classes will be taught throughout the day with parents dropping off and picking up children. There is one room for a nursery with children up to one year. The applicant is planning to make interior remodel changes for the preschool, but is only planning to make minor exterior façade changes to the building with new door, window and exterior lighting fixtures. The interior floor plans show classrooms, office, kitchen, nursery, restrooms, and a teacher's lounge/storage area on the second story of the building. The applicant indicated she will apply for signage approval separately. The applicant plans to construct a playground area for the children at the south west side of the building. The exterior of the existing building is constructed with brown color brick materials. The applicant is planning to make minor exterior façade changes to the building with new door, window and exterior lighting fixtures. The plans show the windows and doors on

the building elevation provided. The landscaping standards for the MCCD call for water conserving landscaping design with use of indigenous species of trees and shrubs. The site will need to be upgraded with landscaping/sprinkler system to comply with Municipal Code 17.68 and MCCD code regulations. A landscaping plan has been submitted for the site with the application materials for the site. The information provided indicates that 24% of the site will be landscaped. There will need to be changes to the landscaping plan to comply with code regarding less sod materials. The plans show the drive access to the parking lot is from Hanauer Street. The site plan shows 15 parking stalls total provided including 4 parking stalls at the Hanauer Street frontage. The MCCD zone allows counting on street parking stalls toward meeting minimum requirements. The applicant indicated there will be a total of 9 staff for the preschool business. One parking stall is required for each staff and one parking stall for each 5 children in the nursery and one parking stall per 2 classrooms. The floor plan shows 5 classrooms. A minimum of 14 parking stalls are required. The applicant is planning to attach new light fixtures to the exterior of the building. The building elevations show the proposed lighting fixtures at the exterior of the building. Exterior lighting and parking lot lighting should be shielded and should not spill onto adjacent properties to comply with MCCD regulations.

Based on analysis of the design review guidelines staff recommends that the overall design is consistent with the design guidelines and recommends that the Design Review Committee recommend approval of the proposed changes for the preschool business use to the Planning Commission with the following conditions:

1. Exterior lighting and parking lot lighting should be shielded and should not spill onto adjacent properties.
2. A formal landscaping/irrigation plan shall be submitted in compliance to code requirements.
3. The trash enclosures shall be screened in compliance to code.
4. All fencing on site shall comply with fence code regulations.
5. Adequate parking stalls shall be paved and striped for the business use to comply with zoning and ADA regulations.

James Carroll is the architect on the project. Mr. Carroll stated there will not be 89 children at the facility all at once. Parents will pick up and drop off throughout the day.

The question was asked if there is a driveway on the north side. Mr. Carroll stated that it is an alley drive.

Isabelle Lopez, 4716 South 200 West, stated that the number of children at one time will depend on what they are licensed for. With the experience she has right now, she does schedule every spot, but there is always someone on vacation, sick or absent. At the busiest time, she feels there wouldn't be more than 35. At her current location she is licensed for 41 children. Mr. Bollwinkel wanted Ms. Lopez to reiterate how many children she has applied to be licensed for. Ms. Lopez stated that they have put in to be licensed for 90 children. Mr. Bollwinkel asked staff if there was any concern on the pick-up and

drop-off. Mr. Wilkinson stated that they have talked with the city engineer and they don't feel there will be any problems. Mr. Hacker made note that it will have to be a left turn in and a left turn out. Ms. Lopez did not like the idea of that at first, but now understands why it is better that way. Mr. Hacker asked if it would be an issue to use the alley way, which is owned by the city. Mr. Wilkinson responded in the negative.

Mr. Bollwinkel recommended planting a shade tree in the play yard. Mr. Carroll stated there was already a shade tree in the yard. Mr. Bollwinkel made note that Ms. Lopez should change out the Bristle Cone with some other type of shade tree. He also wanted to add that in the recommendations.

Mr. Hacker made a motion to forward a recommendation of approval for the proposed changes for a preschool business at the property addressed 4790 South Hanauer Street, based on conditions 1-5 adding a shade tree to the landscaping condition.

Mr. Jones seconded the motion.

A voice vote was made. Motion passed 3-0.

Meeting adjourned.

Chad Wilkinson, Manager
Community & Economic Development