

Minutes of the Design Review Committee meeting held on January 12, 2017, at 5:30 p.m. in the Murray Public Services Building Conference Room, 4646 South 500 West, Murray, Utah.

Present: Design Review Committee:
Ned Hacker, Chair
C.J. Kulp
Fredy Pimentel
Jared Hall, Community Development Manager
Brad McIlrath, Assistant Planner
Stan Hoffman, Dakota Pacific Real Estate Partners
Rob Pett, MGSA Architects
Brandon Reese, MGBA Architects
Greg Ledvera, MGBA Architects
Brian Young, HKS Architects
Cory Morris, Great Basin Engineering
Nathan Murray, TSA Architects
Elliot Setzer, Citizen

Excused: Jay Bullwinkle
Ray Black

Mr. Hacker welcomed all to the meeting and indicated that Mr. Pimentel will be joining the meeting via telephone conference speaker phone.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Hacker asked for approval of minutes from November 22, 2016. Mr. Kulp made a motion to approve the minutes as presented. Seconded by Mr. Pimentel.

The minutes were approved unanimously (3-0).

2. BOARD REPORTS

There were no board reports.

3. Excused

Jay Bullwinkle and Ray Black

4. VINE STREET SENIOR LIVING –184, 188, 190, East Vine Street, 4998, 5000, & 5004 South Jones Court – Project # 17-04

Jared Hall reviewed the location and request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the construction of a new assisted living facility and related uses on the subject properties. The applicant proposes to construct a 120 – 126 unit assisted living facility with related uses contained in a single building on the subject properties. The project would require the demolition of existing structures and combination of the lots into a single parcel for development. The proposed building is four stories, with the ground floor being used principally for the lobby and other common functions of the facility, and the upper floors providing the resident accommodations. This project would include the

demolition of five buildings listed in the ordinance as "historically significant". These buildings are identified as the Carnegie Library, the Murray 1st Ward building (currently Mount Vernon Academy), the Vine Street apartments and the Jones Court duplexes. This is an assisted living use with specific access requirements which will have principal entrances on Vine Street and Jones Court, along with a principal "drop off" access on the interior side. Jones Court and Vine Street frontages have pedestrian entrances as well, including a salon, physical therapy, bistro, library and chapel. Service areas are located on the northwest interior of the site and comply with MCCD guidelines. Parking for the MCCD standard requires forty-seven stalls and this site will accommodate fifty-two with an additional twelve on-street parking stalls along Vine Street. Landscape designs must comply with standards for preserving historical value which would include some garden structures intended to mimic historical features with a gazebo utilizing the unique roof design of the Jones Court duplexes. The garden area which would be open to guests would also be the location for monument plaques including photographs and narratives regarding the historic buildings as approved by the history board. With the removal of the existing buildings and the replacement with the proposed building some of the design elements would recognize the historic nature of the previous structures which would include the tower, the understated use of crenellations on the tower and Vine Street facades, the window designs and recurring arch motif throughout, and a representation of the Carnegie Library at the west end of the Vine Street frontage. The building materials include brick, EIFS, battered masonry, wood, glass storefronts, composite wood panels, and punched windows. Tones reflect the historic buildings and the requirements of the MCCD zone. The proposed building is located within 150 feet of a residential zone which limits the the height to 50 feet. Exceptions in the code allow parapets to extend up to 4 feet, and some architectural features (such as towers, cupolas, and chimneys) are exempted. The overall proposed building height is 50 feet, with a 2 foot parapet. The tower feature has an overall height of 75 feet. The applicant has proposed using historic elements such as murals, photographs, and possibly a stained glass window as a part of the interior design.

Mr. Pimentel was concerned about demolishing buildings with iconic value and explained some of the historic features and age of the Carnegie Library and the Murray 1st Ward Building which are both about one hundred years old. Mr. Pimentel further stated that he understands that the MCCD guidelines allow the demolition of the two buildings as long as the architecture and history are incorporated into the new buildings, and that the intention of the recreated tower structure to display the historical value does not fully reflect the history and urges the team to conduct additional research on the structures. Mr. Hoffman stated this assisted living center will accommodate mostly Murray residents and wants the development of this project to reflect the history of Murray City and has conducted a lot of research, considered several layout schemes, locations and relocations of buildings, and the hire of an operator for this center that will demonstrate these quality's. Mount Vernon Academy was originally under consideration to be integrated into the assisted living facility but due to the condition and unfeasible amount of work and investment to remodel and re-stabilize it, the cost was too large to keep it.

Nathan Murray reviewed the new documents submitted today and stated the exterior rendering shows the chapel had a tower that was taller than the rest of the building and that the tower set a tone to the community as a gathering place as the staircase entry to

the church is through the tower. This project will pay respect to the church by creating the structure on the corner which is iconic itself, as it is the entry way as well and will feature materials that give an enhanced historical decoration as opposed to a plain duplication of the old tower. Mr. Pimentel stated that he is in favor of the MCCD guidelines for preservation of historical features but rather would like to make sure that history is documented and captured within the building itself for the residents. Mr. Murray stated he also wants the interior to reflect the history and tell the story to the residents who will occupy the center daily and further entice the residents to stay in Murray because they want to continue to dwell in this center. Mr. Pett explained that extensive research has been conducted regarding the history of the buildings and stated that the buildings are adjacent to a residential neighborhood and they create a sense of place which can be difficult to recreate with an assisted living building but rather that the new buildings should remind the community about what used to be there and what the effects would be on the neighborhood. Mr. Hoffman referred to the alternate site plan (B1 option) and stated that the Carnegie Library presents a challenge as it does not have a current sponsor that contributed to any upkeep and the B1 options show the library left intact which would require a great deal of restoration and a sponsor which would change the footprint of the drawings but the parking count would still work. Mr. Hoffman showed the next scheme without the Carnegie Library which would allow parking on this site for the Murray Theater; solving the parking problem for them and would encourage community input about the best way to address saving one building or the other. Mr. Pimentel asked staff if any concerns have come up internally about this project. Mr. Hall stated that the feedback to staff has been to look more closely at the architectural components and their relationship to the existing history as the newly presented plan addresses. The MCCD language that new projects need to relate and respond to the history and staff feels that the new plan does respond to the history. Mr. Hall reviewed the process of this project and stated that it has not been presented to the public yet as the first step is for review by the design review committee and the rules of the MCCD guidelines for demolition require the Planning Commission to make a determination that the historic fabric has been respected as the default position of the MCCD code is to keep the buildings if possible. If repurposing them does not work then we must obtain an exception for a demolition. The DRC does not have to make the finding but rather advise the Planning Commission on the topic and the Planning Commission is tasked with deciding if it meets the qualifications for demolition. The City Council will be involved with approving a development agreement that provides guidelines for how the demolition will happen, and the History Advisory Board will be involved with the approval of the historical plaques. If all is approved then the Planning Commission can make the finding in a public hearing to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Hoffman stated that he will be able to present a deeper understanding of all the historical elements and research that have been put into this project in an additional meeting within protocol to help clarify some of the fine line issues of future recognition of this historical site. Mr. Hoffman stated a project that would not include the library would be a much more appealing outcome for the residents of the center as the garden area would be larger, creating very important element to the indoor inclined resident to have a tranquil and calm outdoor space.

Mr. Kulp asked what materials would be used on the tower and the library. Mr. Hoffman stated the tower and library are both currently painted mason brick veneer, the options

are open now but we could use the same type of materials if we are truly trying to respect what is currently on the tower.

Mr. Hacker asked what type of materials would be used on the "eyebrow" of the building. Mr. Pett answered that rather than adding any historical crust to the building in the common area they would propose to use contemporary and simple elements so that you can see the tower and not detract from it. Mr. Pimentel stated that he appreciates the hard work and can see effort has been added to keep the historical features of the existing tower but it does not remind him of the tower in his opinion. Mr. Pimentel asked if the tower has a roof or common area space. Mr. Pett stated that the tower on the plan is currently filled in but could be used as a crow's nest or other common gathering area. Mr. McIlrath suggested that if a recommendation of approval were to be made tonight that it could be made with the comments and concerns of the Design Review Committee are incorporated into the approval process. Mr. Pimentel agreed that he would feel comfortable making a motion on this topic today. Mr. Hoffman proposed the architects have a meeting with Mr. Pimentel as he joined via conference call and was unable to see the Submitted plans. Attendees were in agreement.

Mr. Hacker made a motion to forward a recommendation of approval to the Planning Commission for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Vine Street Senior Living Center application (w/o the Carnegie Library) pending additional research and review by the applicant and the Murray City History Advisory Board, as to the viability/feasibility of restoring the Carnegie Library structure. Seconded by Mr. Kulp.

 A Mr. Hacker
 A Mr. Pimentel
 A Mr. Kulp

Motion passed, 3-0.

4. NORTH STATE MIXED USE –4818, 4832, 4836, 4838, 4854, 4858, 4868, 4874, South State Street, 4837 & 4843 South Poplar Street, 43, 65 & 75 East 5th Ave– Project #17-05

Brad McIlrath reviewed the location and request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a residential & commercial mixed used development to be located at the properties addressed 4818, 4832, 4836, 4838, 4854, 4858, 4868 & 4874 S. State St., 4837 & 4843 S. Poplar St., and 43, 65 & 75 E. Fifth Avenue. This project would include the demolition of buildings down to 5th Avenue and would include two historically significant buildings which are the Harker Building and Murray Mercantile building addressed 4836 – 4842 State Street. The other buildings to be demolished include the Wright Costume, Martial Arts, Vine Street Antiques, Tea Rose Diner, and Murray Arts Center buildings which are not historical in any manner. The historically significant buildings are not individually on the Nation Historical Registration instead they are included on the Murray City Center District list of historically significant structures. Mr. Hall clarified that the term Historical for this report means that the building is located in the Downtown area and have local historic significance. Mr. McIlrath stated that the proposed development would include a park that would require the relocation of the Townsend home to be north of the Cahoon

Mansion, also known as Murray Mansion, the realignment of Hanauer Street and the vacation of Poplar Street. This project would include commercial/retail units on the ground floor along the State Street frontage with apartments occupying floors three to seven. The proposed plans include parking garage entrances from State Street and 5th Avenue. If the State Street access is not approved by UDOT, the plans will be modified to provide this access from the parking lot of the office building to the north. If the State Street access is not approved, that area occupied by the access will need to be used as commercial/retail space which would increase the total square footage of commercial space to 10,576 square feet and require an additional six (6) spaces. The applicant proposes to construct a 205 unit mixed-use retail building at the subject properties. The residential unit mix would include fifteen (15) studios, one hundred and forty nine (149) 1-bedroom units, and forty one (41) 2-bedroom units. The maximum amount of parking allowed for developments with two (2) bedrooms or less is 1.25 spaces per unit. Based upon this ratio, 256 spaces are required for the residential units. With a proposed commercial/retail square footage of 8,101 square feet, sixteen (16) additional spaces are required. With these calculations, a total of 277 parking spaces are required for this project with 334 being provided. The interior space of floors one and two will be occupied by the parking structure. The rear end of the building will include six live/work units that overlook a future park space. The east elevation shows the two towers that would represent the Murray Smokestacks as well as the resemblance of the two historical buildings incorporated into the exterior building façade and other elements to recognize the historic significance of those buildings. Based upon a review of the proposed plans and the Design Review Guidelines, Staff determines that the project is in general conformance with the guidelines with some additional minor alterations such as designing all entries to minimize water and snow fall on pedestrians and the minimization of blank wall surfaces, sustainability standards, drainage, and bio swells.

Mr. Hoffman wanted to clarify that when the architects attempt to reconstruct the buildings they are not actually reconstructing the buildings but instead emulating the façade of the historical buildings. Mr. Hoffman stated that the issue of parking for the 48th and State office building could potentially be solved by rotating the building to front onto 4800 south but would encroach on the footprint of the historic structures, parking, trees and drive through and is highly likely that a revision of the site plan and parking requirements will come forward with the incorporation of the Harker and Mercantile buildings into the mixed use building which would still include the original planned historical façade. Mr. Pimentel stated that he approves of the look of the proposed façade for this development and wanted to suggest that the vehicular entrances and exits be to the rear of the building to elevate the traffic from State Street and mentioned the goal is to have pedestrian friendly access with open areas.

Mr. Kulp asked if the 48th and State office building has enough space to compress the "U" shaped floorplan and still maintain enough clearance for fire services, etc. Mr. Hoffman answered that the safety aspects of the building will be fully addressed as well as the drive thru would be examined as it is an important part of the plan and any changes should not impede the efficiency of the parking lot and any future changes will be brought back to the Design Committee for review.

Mr. Kulp asked for clarification of the reinterpretation and transition for the façade of the buildings. Mr. Pett explained that buildings will feature a two-story edge look with a

setback on the terrace levels which will put an emphasis on a taller historical quality with some smaller details that will show on later plans.

Mr. Pimentel stated that he has concerns that State Street would become an extremely congested area especially with the exit of the bank on to State Street. Mr. Hall stated that a large median along State Street would allow only south bound traffic access to the exits and entrances and with the development of the City Hall and other business to the west of State Street some traffic would be alleviated from State Street and flow onto 5th Avenue and Hanauer. Mr. McIlrath stated a second entrance off of 5th into the garage is proposed. Mr. Hoffman stated that a traffic study is in process to determine the potential need for added convenience entries and exits but their addition creates a loss of parking stalls. Mr. McIlrath stated that the loss of parking stalls is not an issue for city ordinance as the project is over parked as the requirement is to have between 277-280 spaces and 334 are proposed.

Mr. Kulp made a motion to forward a recommendation of approval to the Planning Commission for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new residential and commercial mixed used building to be located at the property addressed 4818, 4832, 4836, 4838, 4854, 4858, 4868 & 4874 S. State St., 4837 & 4843 S. Poplar St., and 43, 65 & 75 E. Fifth Avenue subject to conditions. Seconded by Mr. Pimentel.

1. The residential units located at the west end of the project must be constructed as live/work units.
2. Detailed and colored architectural renderings shall be submitted with labeling for the exterior building materials for review by the Planning Commission.
3. The project shall comply with the sustainability standards outlined in Section 17.170.090 of the Land Use Ordinance and within the MCCD Design Guidelines.
4. The applicant shall obtain approval from the Utah Department of Transportation for the proposed State Street access and the overall project as required by ordinance.
5. The site landscaping shall be designed as a unified palette and shall include onsite treatment of storm water with bioswales and other applicable landscape designs.
6. All site lighting shall comply with the standards outlined by ordinance and found in the MCCD Design Guidelines.
7. The project shall include the installation of pedestrian scale street improvements with street furniture, landscaping and pedestrian pathways.
8. The project shall comply with all other applicable ordinance and MCCD Design Guidelines standards not outlined in this report.

 A Mr. Hacker
 A Mr. Pimentel
 A Mr. Kulp

Design Review Committee
January 12, 2017
Page 7

Motion passed, 3-0.

5. Items from Staff

No additional items from staff.

Meeting adjourned.



Jared Hall,
Community Development Division Manager